

**LAWRENCE HISTORIC RESOURCES COMMISSION
AGENDA MEETING JANUARY 19, 2017 6:30 PM
ACTION SUMMARY**

Commissioners present: Arp, Bailey, Buchanan, Hernly
Staff present: Cargill, Simmons, Zollner

ITEM NO. 1: COMMUNICATIONS

- A. Ms. Zollner said staff received communication from the State Historic Preservation Office verifying the nomination of Olive Stanford's house on the February agenda.
- B. There were no ex-parte communications.
- C. Commissioner Hernly said he would abstain from Administrative Approval DR-16-00499.
- D. There were no Committee Reports.

ITEM NO. 2: CONSENT AGENDA

- A. December 15, 2016 Action Summary
- B. Administrative Approvals
 - 1. DR-16-00488 1144 Rhode Island Street; Accessory Structure Rehabilitation; State Law Review
 - 2. DR-16-00492 888 New Hampshire Street; Sign Permit; Downtown Design Guidelines Review and Certificate of Appropriateness
 - 3. DR-16-00499 719 Massachusetts Street; Sidewalk Dining; State Law Review, Downtown Design Guidelines Review, and Certificate of Appropriateness
 - 4. DR-16-00524 920 Massachusetts Street; Sign Permit; State Law Review, Downtown Design Guidelines Review, and Certificate of Appropriateness
 - 5. DR-16-00525 843 Massachusetts Street; Mechanical Permit; State Law Review
 - 6. DR-16-00526 1326 Massachusetts Street; Residential Remodel; Certificate of Appropriateness
 - 7. DR-16-00527 941 Massachusetts Street; Mechanical Permit; State Law Review

ACTION TAKEN

Motioned by Commissioner Arp, seconded by Commissioner Buchanan, to confirm the Administrative Reviews with the exception of DR-16-00499, pulled for separate vote, and to defer the December 15, 2016 Action Summary.

Unanimously approved 6-0.

Motioned by Commissioner Arp, seconded by Commissioner Fry, to confirm Administrative Approval DR-16-00499.

Motion carried 5-0-1.

ITEM NO. 3: PUBLIC COMMENT

There was no public comment.

ITEM NO. 4: DR-16-00497 319 E. 7th Street; Demolition Permit; Certificate of Appropriateness. The structure is located in the environs of the A. J. Griffin House (645 Connecticut), Lawrence Register of Historic Places. Submitted by Peter Shenouda on behalf of Eric D. Barton, property owner of record.

STAFF PRESENTATION

Ms. Zollner presented the item.

APPLICANT PRESENTATION

Mr. Peter Shenouda, applicant, said his father is looking to purchase the property. He explained how dangerous the property is currently.

Commissioner Hernly asked if graphic documentation will be covered.

Ms. Zollner suggested that should be an added condition.

PUBLIC COMMENT

Ms. KT Walsh said everyone is so sad about this barn but she understands it is a demolition by neglect. She mentioned the rich history tied to the property and reminded the applicant they would be eligible for tax credits.

Mr. Brad Gibson said the applicant would like to remove a structure within the environs of another listed property. He mentioned other projects approved by the HRC that seem far more invasive. He said this property is very unsafe and that denying it would be inappropriate.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Commissioner Buchanan said the house was identified in 1976 as a significant property in reference to the United States bicentennial.

Mr. Shenouda added that they will save as many materials as possible.

Commissioner Quillin said they always look at these projects on a case by case basis and these are special circumstances.

Commissioner Arp agreed and said he doesn't see any other option.

ACTION TAKEN

Motioned by Commissioner Quillin, seconded by Commissioner Arp, to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for 319 E 7th Street and direct staff to administratively review any minor alterations.

Unanimously approved 6-0.

ITEM NO. 5: DR-16-00528 707 Massachusetts Street; New Commercial Addition; State Law Review, Downtown Design Guidelines Review, and Certificate of Appropriateness. The vacant lot is located adjacent to 701 Massachusetts Street and is located in Lawrence's Downtown Historic District, and the Downtown Urban Conservation Overlay District. The property is also located in the environs of Miller's Hall (725 Massachusetts) and the House Building

(729 Massachusetts). Submitted by Paul Werner Architects on behalf of Eldridge Hotel LLC, property owner of record.

ITEM NO. 6: DR-16-00530 817 New York Street; New Residential Construction; Certificate of Appropriateness. The property is located in the environs of the Edward Manter House (821 New York), Lawrence Register of Historic Places. Submitted by Clovis Construction on behalf of Stanley Schaaake, property owner of record.

STAFF PRESENTATION

Ms. Zollner mentioned that the applicant has submitted revised plans that have not yet been reviewed by staff. She asked the applicant if he wants to stick with the original drawings.

Mr. Jan Schaaake, applicant, said he's used to changing things until he begins construction, so he was hesitant to commit to either set of plans.

Ms. Zollner said they can either move forward with the original design the applicant can defer or Commission can defer to the February meeting.

Commissioner Arp asked how they can approve a design if they don't have the current version.

Ms. Zollner said the original and revised plans are included in the packet.

Commissioner Buchanan said she would like staff to review the revised plans before they make a decision.

Commissioner Bailey asked if anyone had a chance to compare the plans.

Commissioner Hernly suggested the applicant could explain the differences.

APPLICANT PRESENTATION

Mr. Schaaake explained the differences between the original and revised set of plans.

Commissioner Bailey asked if the north elevation has changed.

Mr. Schaaake said it has not but staff suggested they add a window or two.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Commissioner Arp said he'd prefer to wait for a staff review of the revised plans.

Commissioner Hernly feels the original submittal looks to be a better design solution.

Commissioner Arp said he has an issue with the garage and parking.

STAFF PRESENTATION

Ms. Zollner presented the item based on the original submittal.

Commissioner Hernly asked if stacked parking will be no longer permitted in all of the Oread Neighborhood or just in the historic district.

Ms. Zollner said she believes that applies to the whole overlay, but probably not in the high density district.

Commissioner Hernly asked if that is still a permitted configuration in other areas.

Ms. Zollner said yes.

Commissioner Arp asked about the attached garage and typical historical patterns.

Ms. Zollner explained the history of the distinct parking patterns in historic districts, which consist mostly of detached parking structures.

Commissioner Hernly asked if a duplex could be a freestanding structure with living space above it.

Ms. Zollner said it would require a Special Use Permit.

Commissioner Arp asked how the standards guide them in a situation like this.

Ms. Zollner said environs is challenging because there's a presumption of approval unless you can show an encroachment. The challenge with this property is the environs review is on a sliding scale, there are no attached garages in the neighborhood, and the pattern in the area shows a distinct spatial relationship. She said the design is contemporary and compatible in many ways, so the Commission must decide if the attached garage is part of the contemporary design or if it is an encroachment on the pattern for the area.

Commissioner Buchanan said stacked parking is proposed and is not appropriate in historic districts.

Commissioner Hernly said it's in the environs of a listed property, not a district.

Commissioner Buchanan argued that if something changes a pattern it alters the environs.

APPLICANT PRESENTATION

Mr. Schaaake reiterated the details of the original submittal.

Commissioner Hernly asked if the bigger door on the garage is for two cars, and the other for a single. He asked if there are three spaces inside and two outside.

Mr. Schaaake said you could park at least three or four outside.

Commissioner Buchanan asked if he would be opposed to all five spaces being outside.

Mr. Schaaake said he'd have all spaces in the front yard if that was going to be a requirement. He further explained design details.

Commissioner Hernly asked about the option of two one-car garages.

Mr. Schaaake said there's a lot of space in the garage and he likes the flexibility of having multiple garage doors for parking and for storage. He feels the more space inside for parking vehicles the more attractive the space will be for tenants.

PUBLIC COMMENT

Mr. Dennis Brown, Lawrence Preservation Alliance (LPA), said they have several issues with the proposal. He said the lot is directly adjacent to a lot registered on the Lawrence Register of Historic Places. He said windows are a big deal in historic environs, and the exterior review is very important. He feels the revised plans have more problems than the original.

Ms. KT Walsh agreed with Mr. Brown's comments. She added that the area is safe so she doesn't agree with the argument in support of attached garages for that purpose. She said they are looking at not allowing stacked parking in potential design guidelines for East Lawrence.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Commissioner Arp said he doesn't think attached garages are appropriate but he's not sure the standards would support that as a blanket statement.

Commissioner Hernly agreed, noting that their task is to determine the attached garage's impact on the listed property.

Commissioner Buchanan feels the attached garage is creating a pattern that is not consistent with the neighborhood.

Commissioner Arp said the pattern of the neighborhood isn't the issue, only the impact on the house next door.

Ms. Zollner said they are looking at the environs of the listed property and how changes impact that property.

Commissioner Buchanan feels there are design solutions that would be appropriate but she feels the current proposal damages the environs.

Commissioner Fry disagreed- he does not feel the project damages the listed property.

Commissioner Bailey reminded them that this is an environs review. He said you can't tell there's a garage door from the listed property, and detaching the garage will only add to the visual massing. He feels it appropriate to always make these decisions on a case-by-case basis.

Commissioner Buchanan feels the lack of a backyard makes the mass inappropriate.

Commissioner Arp acknowledged how difficult it is to meet all of these historic standards while maximizing the use of a lot.

Commissioner Hernly said he doesn't feel the plan is maximizing the lot, if it was it would be a duplex with four bedrooms in each unit and there would be six parking spaces. He said the lack of design guidelines for that area is an issue because developers don't have any direction for building expectations. He discussed other design options.

They agreed the garage needs to be detached and discussed whether the proposed truly damages the listed property.

Mr. Schaake said he doesn't feel the project damages anything.

Commissioner Bailey doesn't feel this project damages the environs.

They agreed the windows on the original submittal are far better than the revision, with the addition of windows on the north side.

Commissioner Fry said he can't get past the fact this should be the least stringent review for a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Commissioner Quillin said the fact that the garage faces the alley minimizes the impact of being attached.

Commissioner Buchanan said she'd like to see options that don't create stacked parking.

ACTION TAKEN

Motioned by Commissioner Bailey, seconded by Commissioner Hernly, to defer the item and direct the applicant to work with the ARC on fenestration on the north side and the dormer on the south side.

Motion carried 5-1 with Commissioner Buchanan dissenting.

ITEM NO. 7: MISCELLANEOUS MATTERS

- A. Provide comment on Zoning Amendments, Special Use Permits, and Zoning Variances received since December 15, 2016.

Ms. KT Walsh asked why they register properties if the review doesn't matter. She discussed the East Lawrence Rezoning process.

Commissioner Hernly said they're learning and the code is in the review process and he reiterated how helpful neighborhood design guidelines are.

Commissioner Bailey asked if Chapter 22 is still being reviewed by the City Attorney's office.

Ms. Zollner said she hopes to have something to the Commission in February.

- B. Review of any demolition permits received since December 15, 2016.
- C. Miscellaneous matters from City staff and Commission members.

Ms. Zollner mentioned that this would be Commissioner Quillin's last meeting and Commissioner Arp's last meeting will be in February.

Commissioner Buchanan asked if being a board member of LPA is a conflict of interest.

Ms. Zollner said no.

ADJOURN 8:22 PM