



City of Lawrence

PLANNING & DEVELOPMENT SERVICES

LAWRENCE HISTORIC RESOURCES COMMISSION ACTION SUMMARY FOR **SEPTEMBER 20, 2018**

Commissioners Present: Bailey, Erby, Evans, Fry, Hernly, Veatch

Staff Present: Dolar, Weik, Zollner

ITEM NO. 1: COMMUNICATIONS

- A. Receive communications from other commissions, State Historic Preservation Officer, and the general public.

Ms. Lynne Zollner mentioned communications included in the agenda packet from the State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO) for the nomination of the First Methodist Episcopal Church, 946 Vermont Street, and the Johnson Block Historic District to the National Register of Historic Places. She made a recommendation that the Commission write a letter in support of the nominations.

Commissioner Hernly said he is a member of the church and supports the nomination. He added that it can be challenging for a large organization to agree on such a decision, and that the nomination process is equally difficult.

Ms. Jane Wheelock, First Methodist Episcopal Church, said the church has history back to Quantrill's Raid and they are excited and honored by the nomination.

Ms. Zollner noted that the Johnson Block was added to the Lawrence Register about a year ago.

ACTION TAKEN

Motioned by Commissioner Hernly, seconded by Commissioner Veatch, to direct staff to draft a letter in support of the nominations for First Methodist Episcopal Church and the Johnson Block Historic District.

Unanimously approved

- B. Disclosure of ex-parte communications.

Commissioner Hernly disclosed that he met with the architect for 804 Pennsylvania Street in July to discuss the project in general.

- C. There were no abstentions.
D. Committee Reports

Ms. Zollner said the Architectural Review Committee (ARC) held their final meeting with the applicant for 700 New Hampshire Street and the project will be scheduled for consideration on a future agenda.

ITEM NO. 2: CONSENT AGENDA

- A. June Action Summary
- B. Administrative Approvals
 1. DR-18-00039 932 Maine Street; Residential Remodel; Oread Design Guidelines Review
 2. DR-18-00093 846 Pennsylvania Street; Commercial Remodel; State Law Review and Design Guidelines 8th & Penn Neighborhood Redevelopment Zone Review
 3. DR-18-00099 800 Massachusetts Street; Commercial Remodel; State Law Review
 4. DR-18-00138 829 Missouri Street; I/I Permit; State Law Review
 5. DR-18-00196 1047 Massachusetts Street; Mechanical Permit; State Law Review
 6. DR-18-00197 1136 Louisiana Street; Electrical Permit; State Law Review
 7. DR-18-00230 623 Massachusetts Street; Commercial Remodel & Sidewalk Dining; Certificate of Appropriateness and Downtown Design Guidelines Review
 8. DR-18-00234 710 Massachusetts Street; Sign Permit; State Law Review, Certificate of Appropriateness and Downtown Design Guidelines Review
 9. DR-18-00235 811 E 12th Street; Residential Addition; Certificate of Appropriateness
 10. DR-18-00236 734 Massachusetts Street; Mechanical Permit; State Law Review
 11. DR-18-00237 929 Massachusetts Street; Mechanical Permit; State Law Review
 12. DR-18-00248 640 Ohio Street; I/I Permit; State Law Review
 13. DR-18-00249 618 Ohio St; I/I Permit; State Law Review
 14. DR-18-00267 630 Indiana Street; I/I Permit; State Law Review
 15. DR-18-00268 1229 Vermont Street; Commercial Remodel; Certificate of Appropriateness
 16. DR-18-00269 825 Massachusetts Street; Commercial Remodel; State Law Review, Certificate of Appropriateness and Downtown Design Guidelines Review
 17. DR-18-00285 1126 Ohio Street; I/I Permit; State Law Review
 18. DR-18-00289 717 Ohio Street; Mechanical Permit; State Law Review
 19. DR-18-00172 Massachusetts Street – 14th to 11th Street; Mill & Overlay: State Law Review and Certificate of Appropriateness
 20. DR-18-00281 623 Massachusetts Street; Sign Permit; Downtown Design Guidelines Review and Certificate of Appropriateness
 21. DR-18-00305 704 Massachusetts Street; Sign Permit; State Law Review, Downtown Design Guidelines Review and Certificate of Appropriateness

22. DR-18-00307 1745 W 24th Street; Commercial Remodel; Certificate of Appropriateness
23. DR-18-00311 716 Massachusetts Street; I/I Permit; State Law Review
24. DR-18-00320 724 Massachusetts Street; Commercial Remodel; State Law Review, Downtown Design Guidelines Review and Certificate of Appropriateness
25. DR-18-00322 716 Louisiana Street; Mechanical Permit; State Law Review
26. DR-18-00323 623 Massachusetts Street; Commercial Remodel; Downtown Design Guidelines Review and Certificate of Appropriateness
27. DR-18-00328 900 New Hampshire Street; Sidewalk Dining; Downtown Design Guidelines Review and Certificate of Appropriateness
28. DR-18-00331 925 Vermont Street; Commercial Remodel; State Law Review
29. DR-18-00332 900 New Hampshire Street; Sign Permit; Downtown Design Guidelines Review and Certificate of Appropriateness
30. DR-18-00334 612 Louisiana Street; I/I Permit; State Law Review
31. DR-18-00339 1224 Rhode Island Street; Plumbing Permit; State Law Review
32. DR-18-00346 703 Indiana Street; I/I Permit; State Law Review
33. DR-18-00347 843 Massachusetts Street; Sign Permit; State Law Review, Downtown Design Guidelines Review and Certificate of Appropriateness
34. DR-18-00348 714 Massachusetts Street; Sign Permit; State Law Review, Downtown Design Guidelines and Certificate of Appropriateness
35. DR-18-00349 1828 Massachusetts Street; Sign Permit; Certificate of Appropriateness
36. DR-18-00360 2341 Massachusetts Street; Electrical Permit; State Law Review
37. DR-18-00367 743 Louisiana Street; I/I Permit; State Law Review
38. DR-18-00368 129 South Park Street; Residential Remodel; Certificate of Appropriateness and Oread Design Guidelines Review
39. DR-18-00369 723 Louisiana Street; I/I Permit; State Law Review
40. DR-18-00370 524 Louisiana Street; I/I Permit; State Law Review
41. DR-18-00372 716 Massachusetts Street; Commercial Remodel; State Law Review, Downtown Design Guidelines and Certificate of Appropriateness
42. DR-18-00374 1317 Massachusetts Street; Residential Remodel; Certificate of Appropriateness and Oread Design Guidelines Review
43. DR-18-00382 701 Louisiana Street; I/I Permit; State Law Review
44. DR-18-00384 8 W 9th Street; ROW Permit; State Law Review
45. DR-18-00388 1338 New Hampshire Street; Electrical Permit; State Law Review
46. DR-18-00389 740 New Hampshire Street; Sign Permit; Downtown Design Guidelines Review and Certificate of Appropriateness
47. DR-18-00390 1027 Vermont Street; Sign Permit; Downtown Design Guidelines Review

48. DR-18-00391 1100 Indiana Street; Sign Permit; Oread Design Guidelines Review
49. DR-18-00392 723 New York Street; Residential Remodel; Certificate of Appropriateness

ACTION TAKEN

Motioned by Commissioner Fry, seconded by Commissioner Evans, to approve the June Action Summary.

Unanimously approved 6-0.

Motioned by Commissioner Bailey, seconded by Commissioner Veatch, to confirm the administrative approvals.

Unanimously approved 6-0.

ITEM NO. 3: PUBLIC COMMENT

Mr. Dennis Brown, Lawrence Preservation Alliance (LPA), said their annual member meeting will be held on October 7, 2018 at 904 Rhode Island Street.

ITEM NO. 4: DR-18-00297 804 Pennsylvania Street; Commercial Addition; State Law Review and Design Guidelines 8th & Penn Neighborhood Redevelopment Zone Review. The property is a contributing structure to the East Lawrence Industrial Historic District, National Register of Historic Places and is located in the 8th & Pennsylvania Urban Conservation Overlay District. Submitted by Paul Werner Architects on behalf of Ohio Mortgage Investors, property owner of record.

STAFF PRESENTATION

Ms. Zollner presented the item.

APPLICANT PRESENTATION

Mr. Paul Werner, Paul Werner Architects, explained that they view the project in three separate parts: the existing historic structure, the glass structure, and the kitchen addition. He explained the importance of the kitchen addition, and showed several iterations of the project and their final version submitted to City staff. He further explained details of the project.

No public comment.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Commissioner Evans felt the overall direction of the project is appropriate and that it only needs fine-tuning.

Commissioner Fry asked about the glass and the materials on the west side.

Commissioner Evans said they should address the relationship of the addition to the historic structure as well as the materials proposed.

Commissioner Bailey asked what materials staff feels are compatible.

Ms. Zollner explained that it's difficult to determine appropriate materials until the building design is finalized.

Commissioner Bailey asked how old the site plan might be.

Ms. Zollner said there was a metal garage building indicated on Sanborn maps where the addition is proposed.

Commissioner Hernly asked if staff's primary concern with the wood siding is the horizontal orientation or the material alone.

Ms. Zollner said the material and the fact that it is unpainted is an issue for staff.

Commissioner Bailey said he's not concerned about the overall height of the project.

Commissioner Evans said there's a lack of continuity in the three pieces of the property. He felt the ARC could work on that aspect.

Commissioner Bailey mentioned the amount of equipment housed in a kitchen and the amount of glass on that addition.

Commissioner Evans said the sloped roof offers an opportunity for glass to allow for light and breaking up the massing.

Commissioner Hernly said buildings to the south have fairly low window to solid proportions, but they all have windows on the street side.

Commissioner Bailey mentioned the staff concern about mullions.

Ms. Zollner said there are systems that have less breaks in the glass which would make it a more open glass area with less massing.

Commissioner Veatch said he doesn't understand that recommendation.

Ms. Zollner explained that by reducing the massing and creating a more open glass block it would act as a hyphen between the historic stone structure and the kitchen addition.

Commissioner Veatch asked the applicant about the breaks in the glass.

Mr. Werner said they need to do some research but felt they could come up with something with a smaller mullion.

Commissioner Hernly asked if the existing glass roof has any issues during permitting with energy code regulations.

Mr. Werner said he didn't think so, it is semi-climate controlled but has issues with leakage due to the number of seams.

Commissioner Hernly asked if Commissioner Evans felt that including stone on the kitchen addition would help build its relationship with the historic structure.

Commissioner Evans said no, although he wondered what it might look like if the entire structure was glass. He didn't feel the wood was an issue.

Commissioner Bailey said he wouldn't be opposed to stone on the addition. He said it sounds like the ARC can address the remaining issues.

ACTION TAKEN

Motioned by Commissioner Bailey, seconded by Commissioner Hernly, to refer the project to the Architectural Review Committee to work on recommendations as identified in the staff report.

Unanimously approved 6-0.

ITEM NO. 5: DR-18-00396 945 Kentucky Street; Residential Rehabilitation; State Law Review, Oread Design Guidelines Review and Certificate of Appropriateness. The structure is listed as a contributing structure in the Oread Historic District, National Register of Historic Places, and is located in the Oread Neighborhood Conservation Overlay District. The property is also located in the environs of the Oread Neighborhood Historic District (1000 Block west side of Tennessee Street and 1000 Block east side of Ohio Street), and the Charles and Adeline Duncan House (933 Tennessee), Lawrence Register of Historic Places. Submitted by Dale Nimz on behalf of Michael Heitmann, property owner of record.

STAFF PRESENTATION

Ms. Katherine Weik presented the item.

Commissioner Hernly noted that he did have ex parte contact with the applicant before the design work started on the project.

APPLICANT PRESENTATION

Mr. Dale Nimz, applicant, thanked staff for help on the project. He explained the history and details of the proposed project, and noted that he does not feel that asphalt shingles are a character defining feature.

PUBLIC COMMENT

Mr. Dennis Brown, LPA, pointed out that during their evaluation of 904 Rhode Island Street, this was the second property they were concerned with. They feel it's an important property and are pleased that the applicant has taken on this project.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Commissioner Hernly asked if there is a tax credit application for this project.

Ms. Zollner said yes, it was just submitted.

Commissioner Bailey asked if the proposed roof would disqualify the applicant from tax credits.

Ms. Zollner said they haven't made a determination but they will review whether the material is appropriate. She noted that staff hasn't determined that the asphalt shingles are historic but that

they have been in place since the earliest available record and evidence of a metal roof has not been found.

Commissioner Bailey asked if there was concern about the metal roof on the porch.

Ms. Zollner said that historically, that type of porch was covered by a metal roof.

Commissioner Hernly asked if there is evidence of a larger porch.

Ms. Zollner said they found ghost marks of a larger porch and Sanborn maps indicated a larger porch as well.

Commissioner Hernly said that this type of porch historically did not have stone below, it would have a wood frame or pilasters with columns and maybe lattice to close the gap.

Commissioner Fry asked if it's a listed structure.

Ms. Zollner said it's contributing so it's comparable to a listed property.

Ms. Weik said staff didn't feel the stone was completely out of character with the neighborhood.

Ms. Zollner said it's certainly something the Commission can discuss.

Commissioner Fry said the contributory nature should indicate a decreasing nature of review.

Commissioner Veatch said it should be treated no different than a listed structure.

Ms. Zollner clarified that they are referring to the State Law Review.

Commissioner Hernly felt the pilasters would be more appropriate for the time period of the structure.

Ms. Zollner said that is accurate.

Commissioner Hernly said it will likely be an issue during the review by the SHPO for the tax credit application. He asked whether their approval should wait until after the SHPO has responded.

Ms. Zollner said their reviews are separate and not connected to approval of tax credits.

Commissioner Veatch suggested the porch and metal roof are issues that could be addressed by the ARC.

Mr. Dale Nimz agreed that the pilasters and lattice would be more appropriate for this structure. He said they would be willing to discuss the porch and the roof material. He said they are currently focused on masonry repointing and wood window repair and wondered if they could start immediately on those parts of the project.

Commissioner Hernly asked if either of those parts would require a permit.

Ms. Zollner said no, unless the size of the window is changing.

Commissioner Hernly agreed that it's important to get started on the masonry because the wrong mortar can damage the bricks. He asked if they are seeking Federal tax credits.

Mr. Nimz said yes.

Commissioner Bailey said ARC is a good option.

Commissioner Hernly agreed.

ACTION TAKEN

Motioned Commissioner Bailey, seconded by Commissioner Evans, to refer the project to the Architectural Review Committee to work on the porch and roofing materials.

Unanimously approved 6-0.

Motioned by Commissioner Bailey, seconded by Commissioner Veatch, to issue the Certificate of Appropriateness and find that the proposed project will not significantly encroach on, damage, or destroy the landmarks or their environs.

Unanimously approved 6-0.

ITEM NO. 6: DR-18-00397 1215 Delaware Street; Residential Addition & Detached Garage; Certificate of Appropriateness. The structure is located in the environs of the John & Mina Madson House (1208 Delaware), Lawrence Register of Historic Places. Submitted by Forward Design Architecture on behalf of Christian Beer, property owner of record.

STAFF PRESENTATION

Ms. Zollner presented the item.

APPLICANT PRESENTATION

Mr. Chris Fein, Forward Design Architecture, explained details of the proposed project.

PUBLIC COMMENT

Ms. KT Walsh, East Lawrence Neighborhood Association (ELNA), welcomed the property owners to the neighborhood. She said members of ELNA are nervous about the project, particularly the size of the outbuilding. She said they trust staff and the Commission to adhere to guidelines in reviewing the project. Ms. Walsh added that the type of tree should be considered before they choose to keep it.

A member of the public said it is an oak tree.

Ms. Walsh said ELNA is concerned there might be a deck on the outbuilding and they concurred with the gabled addition. She pointed out that metal siding in the area is not prevalent and is new, not historic.

Mr. Dennis Brown, LPA, said they agree with the staff report and feel the ancillary structure and addition roof should be further reviewed. He added that wood siding would help detract from the ancillary structure and a higher roof on the addition would better hide that structure.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Commissioner Hernly asked which elevation is the current proposal for the addition.

Mr. Fein placed a perspective rendering on the overhead to clarify the proposed plan.

Commissioner Bailey asked if staff is recommending a gable roof on the addition that is shorter than the main structure.

Ms. Zollner said it would likely be taller.

They looked at more renderings provided by the applicant.

Commissioner Bailey noted that it is a Certificate of Appropriateness review but he acknowledged the issue with the roof. He didn't feel the metal siding was an issue and noted that a gable roof on the addition hides the accessory structure.

Commissioner Hernly agreed but the roof would become more dominant.

Commissioner Veatch said it's more typical to have a gable, even if it does add massing.

Commissioner Evans said there is a brutal lack of fenestration on the addition.

Commissioner Bailey felt the fenestration wasn't an issue under a Certificate of Appropriateness review.

Commissioner Fry noted the criteria for a Certificate of Appropriateness.

They further discussed what should be considered under the Certificate of Appropriateness review.

Commissioner Bailey said the ARC could look at altering the roof line. He explained the ARC process to the applicant.

Mr. Fein asked if the version with the gable roof can be approved at this time.

Commissioner Bailey asked if that's a possibility.

Commissioner Veatch said they still must consider the outbuilding.

Commissioner Hernly said the gable might alleviate the issue of the outbuilding.

Commissioner Bailey didn't feel the outbuilding was an issue because it's not visible from the listed property.

They continued to discuss what should be considered under the Certificate of Appropriateness review.

Commissioner Bailey asked if commissioners would like the ARC to address the accessory structure.

Commissioner Erby asked if they intend to look at the project with a gable roof.

Commissioner Bailey said that's correct.

Ms. Zollner said that typically a new plan should be submitted to staff but the Commission has the authority to approve an amended project or to send the project to the ARC.

Commissioner Veatch said they should look at the whole project, to include the gable roof and the outbuilding.

ACTION TAKEN

Motioned by Commissioner Bailey to refer the project to the Architectural Review Committee to work on the gable roof as well as the bump out on the south side.

Motion withdrawn.

Motioned by Commissioner Hernly, seconded by Commissioner Evans, to refer the project to the Architectural Review Committee to work on the roofline of the house addition and materials for the outbuilding.

Motion denied 3-3, Commissioners Erby, Fry, and Bailey dissent.

Motioned by Commissioner Hernly, seconded by Commissioner Evans, to refer the project to the Architectural Review Committee to work on the roofline of the addition.

Unanimously approved 6-0.

ITEM NO. 7: MISCELLANEOUS MATTERS

- A. Provide comment on Zoning Amendments, Special Use Permits, and Zoning Variances received since June 21, 2018.
- 941 Pennsylvania Street Zoning Variances

Commissioner Bailey asked for clarification of the request.

Ms. Weik clarified the variance request.

Commissioner Veatch asked why they provide comment.

Ms. Zollner said it's in environs.

Commissioner Veatch asked what environs.

Ms. Zollner said that information was not included in the packet. She said the work would like be administratively approved. She listed the many listed properties that 941 Pennsylvania is within environs.

The Commission did not provide comment.

- B. Review of any demolition permits received since June 21, 2018.

There were no demolition permits to review.

C. Miscellaneous matters from City staff and Commission members.

- 826 Rhode Island Street changes to approved plan

Ms. Zollner said the columns didn't match on the final building permit but staff administratively approved that change.

- Appoint a Historic Resources Commissioner to serve on the Steering Committee for the Downton Master Plan. The Steering Committee will advise, review, and provide feedback to the consultant, within the framework of the project scope, throughout the process for drafting the Downtown Master Plan.

Ms. Zollner explained the purpose of the committee.

The Commission appointed Commissioner Veatch to the Downtown Master Plan Steering Committee.

- Materials request for 1346 Maple Lane

Ms. Zollner explained the request for vinyl windows on the project. There were unique circumstances for the project and the environs definition.

Commissioner Bailey abstained from the item.

There was no public comment.

ACTION TAKEN

Motioned by Commissioner Evans, seconded by Commissioner Fry, to approve the request.

Motion carried 5-0-1.

GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT

Ms. KT Walsh, ELNA, asked for status and guidance regarding a conservation overlay district for East Lawrence. She asked that they formally request that the City Commission assign a staff member to the project.

They discussed the appropriate way to address the request.

Commissioner Hernly said the most helpful step would be for the City to obtain grant money to hire a consultant to write the guidelines.

Commissioner Veatch noted they previously prioritized projects for grant funding.

Ms. Zollner said they did write and received grant funding for a survey of the Barker Neighborhood.

Ms. Walsh said they just need to know their next steps as a neighborhood.

Mr. Dennis Brown, LPA, recalled the HRC intended to meet with the Mayor and future Mayor to stress the importance of guidelines.

Commissioner Hernly asked what ELNA feels would be most helpful.

Ms. Walsh said they would like to make the need for guidelines public and start having conversations about it, as well as an idea of how much money they need to raise.

Commissioner Hernly noted that the City initiated the Oread Design Guidelines, not the neighborhood.

The Commission decided they would like staff to draft a letter from the HRC expressing support for funding and staff time in an effort to create guidelines for East Lawrence.

Ms. Zollner said they can bring the letter back for review.

ADJOURN 8:46 PM