



505 Davis Road
Elgin, IL 60123

847.697.2640
walkerconsultants.com

December 7, 2017

Mr. Jason Stowe
Building and Structures Manager
City of Lawrence
6 East 6th Street
Lawrence, KS 66044

Re: *Bid Review For
Riverfront Parking Structure Maintenance Repairs
Lawrence, Kansas
Walker Project No. 31-8143.00*

Dear Jason:

Walker has reviewed bids for the Riverfront Parking Structure Maintenance Repairs project. Bids were received from nine contractors. The bids were received as follows:

Contractor	Bid Amount
Restoration and Waterproofing Contractors, Inc.	\$ 191,637.50
Tarlton Corporation	\$ 196,000.00
MTS Contracting Inc.	\$ 198,870.00
Concrete Strategies	\$ 222,445.86
John Rohrer Contracting Company, Inc.	\$ 229,830.00
McGill Restoration	\$ 230,002.60
C & M Restoration Co., Inc.	\$ 269,310.00
Mobile Enterprises, Inc.*	\$ 269,781.00
Chamberlin Contracting	\$ 317,984.00
Bettis Asphalt and Construction	\$ 332,800.00

*Failed to fill out addendum

All of the bids received were within the normal competitive range for a project of this size and type. Through our review, Walker identified that the project examples that the low bidder, Restoration and Waterproofing Contractors, Inc. provided in Section 000500 – Contractor's Qualification Statement for Restoration Work were in the nature of masonry restoration work and not concrete parking structure restoration. Since this bidder did not provide examples of projects where they successfully performed work on parking structures, Walker Consultants believes this bidder is not qualified to perform the work for this project and recommends that this bid not be accepted.



The second lowest bidder for the work, Tarlton Corporation, provided five examples of successfully completed parking structure restoration projects in Section 000500 – Contractor's Qualification Statement for Restoration Work. Additionally, they stated that they are currently working on several parking structure projects as well. Walker Consultants recommends that the City of Lawrence accept Tarlton Corporation as the lowest qualified contractor for this work based on the information provided to us in the Section 000500 – Contractor's Qualification Statement for Restoration Work.

Lastly, Walker Consultants recommends that a 10% to 15% Owner controlled contingency be reserved by owners for hidden conditions that are discovered during the repair process. Therefore, we recommend that a construction contingency of \$30,000 be included in the budget. This contingency is Owner controlled, therefore, the use of this money will not be allowed without expressed written consent from Ownership through the change order process established in the construction documents.

We appreciate the opportunity to assist you with this project. Please do not hesitate to call me if you have any questions.

Sincerely,
WALKER CONSULTANTS

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "William O. Wilson".

William O. Wilson, P.E.
Restoration Engineer

WOW:cgm

Attachment: Bid Review



WRC PROJECT NO. 31-8142.00

DECEMBER 7, 2017

Riverfront Parking Structure Maintenance Repair – Bid Review

				MTS Contracting Inc		Tarlton		Restoration and Waterproofing Contractors, inc.		C & M Restoration Co., INC.		John Rohrer Contracting Company, INC.		McGill		Chamberlin Contracting		Bettis Asphalt and Construction		Mobile Enterprises, Inc.		Concrete Strategies	
Work Item	Description	Units	Quantity	Unit Price	Extension	Unit Price	Extension	Unit Price	Extension	Unit Price	Extension	Unit Price	Extension	Unit Price	Extension	Unit Price	Extension	Unit Price	Extension	Unit Price	Extension	Unit Price	Extension
1.1	General Requirements	L.S.	1	\$ 10,000.00	\$ 10,000.00	\$ 39,956.00	\$ 39,956.00	\$ 2,500.00	\$ 2,500.00	\$ 40,785.00	\$ 40,785.00	\$ 37,200.00	\$ 37,200.00	\$ 44,990.00	\$ 44,990.00	\$ 31,300.00	\$ 31,300.00	\$ 60,000.00	\$ 60,000.00	\$ 53,451.00	\$ 53,451.00	\$ 30,472.16	\$ 30,472.16
3.1	Floor Repair - Partial Depth	S.F.	1030	\$ 43.00	\$ 44,290.00	\$ 46.00	\$ 47,380.00	\$ 35.25	\$ 36,307.50	\$ 38.50	\$ 39,655.00	\$ 50.00	\$ 51,500.00	\$ 55.00	\$ 56,650.00	\$ 124.00	\$ 127,720.00	\$ 65.00	\$ 66,950.00	\$ 85.00	\$ 87,550.00	\$ 44.57	\$ 45,907.10
5.1	Beam Repair	S.F.	20	\$ 200.00	\$ 4,000.00	\$ 120.00	\$ 2,400.00	\$ 47.50	\$ 950.00	\$ 441.00	\$ 8,820.00	\$ 275.00	\$ 5,500.00	\$ 165.00	\$ 3,300.00	\$ 261.00	\$ 5,220.00	\$ 200.00	\$ 4,000.00	\$ 225.00	\$ 4,500.00	\$ 130.98	\$ 2,619.60
6.1	Column Repair	S.F.	10	\$ 200.00	\$ 2,000.00	\$ 105.00	\$ 1,050.00	\$ 47.50	\$ 475.00	\$ 441.00	\$ 4,410.00	\$ 250.00	\$ 2,500.00	\$ 239.04	\$ 2,390.40	\$ 213.00	\$ 2,130.00	\$ 200.00	\$ 2,000.00	\$ 250.00	\$ 2,500.00	\$ 153.37	\$ 1,533.70
6.6	Haunch Reapir	S.F.	10	\$ 400.00	\$ 4,000.00	\$ 170.00	\$ 1,700.00	\$ 47.50	\$ 475.00	\$ 553.00	\$ 5,530.00	\$ 300.00	\$ 3,000.00	\$ 662.00	\$ 6,620.00	\$ 324.00	\$ 3,240.00	\$ 300.00	\$ 3,000.00	\$ 500.00	\$ 5,000.00	\$ 243.13	\$ 2,431.30
7.1	Wall Repair - Partial Depth	S.F.	70	\$ 200.00	\$ 14,000.00	\$ 112.00	\$ 7,840.00	\$ 47.50	\$ 3,325.00	\$ 330.00	\$ 23,100.00	\$ 150.00	\$ 10,500.00	\$ 150.00	\$ 10,500.00	\$ 200.00	\$ 14,000.00	\$ 115.00	\$ 8,050.00	\$ 175.00	\$ 12,250.00	\$ 155.09	\$ 10,856.30
8.1	Tee Stem Repair	S.F.	10	\$ 244.00	\$ 2,440.00	\$ 125.00	\$ 1,250.00	\$ 47.50	\$ 475.00	\$ 441.00	\$ 4,410.00	\$ 200.00	\$ 2,000.00	\$ 226.02	\$ 2,260.20	\$ 395.00	\$ 3,950.00	\$ 200.00	\$ 2,000.00	\$ 350.00	\$ 3,500.00	\$ 148.00	\$ 1,480.00
8.4	Tee Flange Repair	S.F.	160	\$ 150.00	\$ 24,000.00	\$ 108.00	\$ 17,280.00	\$ 47.50	\$ 7,600.00	\$ 274.00	\$ 43,840.00	\$ 75.00	\$ 12,000.00	\$ 125.00	\$ 20,000.00	\$ 287.00	\$ 45,920.00	\$ 180.00	\$ 28,800.00	\$ 135.00	\$ 21,600.00	\$ 104.84	\$ 16,774.40
8.5	Tee Flange Repair - Full Depth	S.F.	20	\$ 100.00	\$ 2,000.00	\$ 125.00	\$ 2,500.00	\$ 487.00	\$ 9,740.00	\$ 161.00	\$ 3,220.00	\$ 150.00	\$ 3,000.00	\$ 325.00	\$ 6,500.00	\$ 195.00	\$ 3,900.00	\$ 270.00	\$ 5,400.00	\$ 285.00	\$ 5,700.00	\$ 143.76	\$ 2,875.20
8.6	Clean and Paint Shear Connectors	EA.	130	\$ 98.00	\$ 12,740.00	\$ 19.00	\$ 2,470.00	\$ 27.00	\$ 3,510.00	\$ 32.00	\$ 4,160.00	\$ 101.00	\$ 13,130.00	\$ 25.00	\$ 3,250.00	\$ 43.00	\$ 5,590.00	\$ 60.00	\$ 7,800.00		\$ -	\$ 25.39	\$ 3,300.70
10.3	Expansion Joint Replacement	L.F.	120	\$ 145.00	\$ 17,400.00	\$ 100.00	\$ 12,000.00	\$ 200.00	\$ 24,000.00	\$ 124.00	\$ 14,880.00	\$ 150.00	\$ 18,000.00	\$ 105.00	\$ 12,600.00	\$ 156.00	\$ 18,720.00	\$ 300.00	\$ 36,000.00	\$ 125.00	\$ 15,000.00	\$ 123.39	\$ 14,806.80
10.4	Expansion Joint Replacement at Stairs	L.F.	60	\$ 120.00	\$ 7,200.00	\$ 140.00	\$ 8,400.00	\$ 225.00	\$ 13,500.00	\$ 115.00	\$ 6,900.00	\$ 175.00	\$ 10,500.00	\$ 105.00	\$ 6,300.00	\$ 161.00	\$ 9,660.00	\$ 80.00	\$ 4,800.00		\$ -	\$ 127.28	\$ 7,636.80
11.1	Rout and Seal Cracks	L.F.	200	\$ 10.00	\$ 2,000.00	\$ 7.50	\$ 1,500.00	\$ 6.50	\$ 1,300.00	\$ 18.00	\$ 3,600.00	\$ 7.50	\$ 1,500.00	\$ 9.23	\$ 1,846.00	\$ 5.75	\$ 1,150.00	\$ 50.00	\$ 10,000.00	\$ 6.50	\$ 1,300.00	\$ 8.11	\$ 1,622.00
11.2	Construction Joint Replacement	L.F.	200	\$ 10.00	\$ 2,000.00	\$ 8.50	\$ 1,700.00	\$ 6.50	\$ 1,300.00	\$ 14.00	\$ 2,800.00	\$ 15.00	\$ 3,000.00	\$ 7.53	\$ 1,506.00	\$ 5.15	\$ 1,030.00	\$ 50.00	\$ 10,000.00	\$ 7.50	\$ 1,500.00	\$ 8.66	\$ 1,732.00
11.3	Vertical Joint Replacement	L.F.	120	\$ 10.00	\$ 1,200.00	\$ 11.45	\$ 1,374.00	\$ 4.00	\$ 480.00	\$ 15.00	\$ 1,800.00	\$ 25.00	\$ 3,000.00	\$ 12.00	\$ 1,440.00	\$ 6.70	\$ 804.00	\$ 50.00	\$ 6,000.00	\$ 24.00	\$ 2,880.00	\$ 16.49	\$ 1,978.80
11.4	Tee to Tee Joint Replacement	L.F.	900	\$ 6.00	\$ 5,400.00	\$ 9.00	\$ 8,100.00	\$ 5.50	\$ 4,950.00	\$ 12.50	\$ 11,250.00	\$ 7.50	\$ 6,750.00	\$ 11.00	\$ 9,900.00	\$ 6.00	\$ 5,400.00	\$ 30.00	\$ 27,000.00	\$ 7.00	\$ 6,300.00	\$ 8.41	\$ 7,569.00
15.1	Penetrating Concrete Sealer	S.F.	85000	\$ 0.52	\$ 44,200.00	\$ 0.46	\$ 39,100.00	\$ 0.95	\$ 80,750.00	\$ 0.59	\$ 50,150.00	\$ 0.55	\$ 46,750.00	\$ 0.47	\$ 39,950.00	\$ 0.45	\$ 38,250.00	\$ 0.60	\$ 51,000.00	\$ 0.55	\$ 46,750.00	\$ 0.81	\$ 68,850.00
					\$ 198,870.00		\$ 196,000.00		\$ 191,637.50		\$ 269,310.00		\$ 229,830.00		\$ 230,002.60		\$ 317,984.00		\$ 332,800.00		\$ 269,781.00		\$ 222,445.86
																				FAILED TO FILL OUT ADDENDUM			