

WALTER P MOORE

August 4, 2017

Ms. Leah Morris
Project Engineer
City of Lawrence
720 W. 3rd Street
P.O. Box 708
Lawrence, KS 6604

Re: Kaw River WTP – Basin Repairs
City Project No. UT1503
WPM Project: D08.15017.01
Bidder Recommendation

Dear Leah:

Walter P Moore has reviewed the bids pertaining to the referenced project. John Rohrer Contracting was determined to be the lowest grand total, lump sum bidder. However, it was noted that John Rohrer Contracting did not include written acknowledgement and acceptance of Addenda 1 prior to the opening of bids. However, the authorizing agent for John Rohrer Contracting was contacted immediately following the bid opening. It was verbally confirmed that Addenda 1 would be subsequently acknowledged and accepted in writing and would not result in any modifications of the submitted bid. Written acknowledgement and acceptance of Addenda 1 was submitted and received on August 1, 2017.

Additionally, within the bid submittal by John Rohrer Contracting there were three clerical errors discovered.

The first error is specific to Task Item 1.1 within the presedimentation basin. A value within the 'Unit Price' column of \$9,291.00 was provided. However, a value of \$10,016.00 was listed within the 'Extension' column. The total for the presedimentation basin repairs, as well as the grand total for all Work within the scope of UT1503, was based on a corresponding value of \$10,016.00 specific to Task Item 1.1 within the presedimentation basin. As such, because this clerical error does not result in an increase to the grand total of the project it is recommended that the value provided within the 'Extension' column for Task Item 1.1 be accepted.

The second and third errors discovered were specific to the north secondary basin. John Rohrer Contracting mistakenly used a base bid quantity of 100SF for Task Item 3.1. This mistake was reflected in the value provided within the 'Extension' column. However, the authorizing agent for John Rohrer Contracting agreed to honor the 'Unit Price' of \$155.00 as provided. This will result in a reduction to the total for the north secondary basin, as well as the grand total for all Work within the scope of UT1503. However, it was also discovered that the value originally provided as the total for all Work specific to the north secondary basin was not accurately calculated. The original calculation was listed as \$491,593.00. However, once the reduction corresponding to Task Item 3.1 was taken into consideration the total value for all Work within the north secondary basin was calculated to be \$488,936.00. This correction resulted in a net reduction of \$2,657.


This in turn resulted in an adjusted Grand Total of \$1,058,526. These corrections were acknowledged and agreed upon by John Rohrer Contracting.

In addition to fee, we have also reviewed the entirety of the bid submitted by John Rohrer Contracting, including the qualifications and references provided within their bid. It is our opinion, based on our due diligence research and our working history with John Rohrer Contracting that they are sufficiently qualified to satisfactorily perform the repairs within the scope of the referenced project.

Therefore, we recommend that the City of Lawrence award the contract for UT1503 to John Rohrer Contracting.

Sincerely,

WALTER P. MOORE AND ASSOCIATES, INC.

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Kyle Dominisse', with a long, sweeping horizontal stroke extending to the right.

Kyle Dominisse, P.E.
Senior Associate

Kaw River WTP - Basin Repairs
City Project No. UT 1503
WPM Project No. D08-15017-01
Date: Wednesday, August 2, 2017

COLOR KEY: % Difference > 10%
 % Difference > 25%
 % Difference > 50%

				John Rohrer Contracting Company		Western Specialty Contractors'		% Difference
Task Item	Task Description	Units	Base Bid Quantity	Unit Price	EXTENSION (1) X (2)	Unit Price	EXTENSION (1) X (2)	
PRESEDIMENTATION BASIN								
1.1	Project Mobilization	L.S.	1	\$ 9,291.00	\$ 10,016.00	\$ 20,075.00	\$ 20,075.00	50%
1.2	Concrete Formwork	Incidental						
1.3	Shoring							
2.1	Concrete Topping Repair	S.F.	775	\$ 41.00	\$ 31,775.00	\$ 61.00	\$ 47,275.00	33%
2.3	Partial Depth Concrete Floor Repair	S.F.			\$ -		\$ -	
2.4	Full Depth Concrete Floor Repair	S.F.			\$ -		\$ -	
2.6	Concrete Curb Repair	S.F.			\$ -		\$ -	
2.7	Concrete Topping Removal And Replacement	S.F.			\$ -		\$ -	
2.8	Concrete Curb Removal And New Topping Replacement	S.F.			\$ -		\$ -	
3.1	Overhead Slab Repair	S.F.			\$ -		\$ -	
4.1	Concrete Wall Repair	S.F.	25	\$ 124.00	\$ 3,100.00	\$ 283.00	\$ 7,075.00	56%
4.2	Concrete Wall – Flume Replacement	S.F.			\$ -		\$ -	
4.3	Concrete Wall – Platform Slab Replacement	S.F.			\$ -		\$ -	
5.1A & 5.1B	Column Repair	S.F.			\$ -		\$ -	
7.1	Crack Repair	L.F.		\$ 16.00	\$ -		\$ -	
7.5	Cove Sealant Installation	Incidental to Task Items 10.5						
7.6	Epoxy Injection	L.F.			\$ -		\$ -	
10.5	Clean, Coat, And Seal Base Of Handrail Posts	EA	75	\$ 78.00	\$ 5,850.00	\$ 112.00	\$ 8,400.00	30%
12.2	Remove Flocculation Paddles In Secondary Basins	L.S.			\$ -		\$ -	
12.3	Seal Flocculation Paddle Shaft Penetration In Basin Wall	EA			\$ -		\$ -	
12.4	Remove Rotating Arm Sweeps In Secondary Basins	L.S.			\$ -		\$ -	
12.5	Repair Weir Closure Plate	EA			\$ -		\$ -	
12.6	Repair Damaged Guardrail	L.S.			\$ -		\$ -	
PRESED BASIN SUBTOTAL				TOTAL	\$ 50,741.00	TOTAL	\$ 82,825.00	39%

				John Rohrer Contracting Company		Western Specialty Contractors'		% Difference
Task Item	Task Description	Units	Base Bid Quantity	Unit Price	EXTENSION (1) X (2)	Unit Price	EXTENSION (1) X (2)	
SOUTH PRIMARY BASIN								
1.1	Project Mobilization	L.S.	1	\$ 20,706.00	\$ 20,706.00	\$ 43,600.00	\$ 43,600.00	53%
1.2	Concrete Formwork	Incidental						
1.3	Shoring	Incidental						
2.1	Concrete Topping Repair	S.F.			\$ -		\$ -	
2.3	Partial Depth Concrete Floor Repair	S.F.	450	\$ 57.00	\$ 25,650.00	\$ 71.00	\$ 31,950.00	20%
2.4	Full Depth Concrete Floor Repair	S.F.			\$ -		\$ -	
2.6	Concrete Curb Repair	S.F.	25	\$ 68.00	\$ 1,700.00	\$ 158.00	\$ 3,950.00	57%
2.7	Concrete Topping Removal And Replacement	S.F.			\$ -		\$ -	
2.8	Concrete Curb Removal And New Topping Replacement	S.F.			\$ -		\$ -	
3.1	Overhead Slab Repair	S.F.	60	\$ 133.00	\$ 7,980.00	\$ 275.00	\$ 16,500.00	52%
4.1	Concrete Wall Repair	S.F.	25	\$ 95.00	\$ 2,375.00	\$ 283.00	\$ 7,075.00	66%
4.2	Concrete Wall – Flume Replacement	S.F.			\$ -		\$ -	
4.3	Concrete Wall – Platform Slab Replacement	S.F.			\$ -		\$ -	
5.1A & 5.1B	Column Repair	S.F.	50	\$ 112.00	\$ 5,600.00	\$ 320.00	\$ 16,000.00	65%
7.1	Crack Repair	L.F.	150	\$ 16.00	\$ 2,400.00	\$ 14.00	\$ 2,100.00	13%
7.5	Cove Sealant Installation	Incidental to Task Items 10.5						
7.6	Epoxy Injection	L.F.	750	\$ 43.00	\$ 32,250.00	\$ 66.00	\$ 49,500.00	35%
10.5	Clean, Coat, And Seal Base Of Handrail Posts	EA	80	\$ 78.00	\$ 6,240.00	\$ 112.00	\$ 8,960.00	30%
12.2	Remove Flocculation Paddles In Secondary Basins	L.S.			\$ -		\$ -	
12.3	Seal Flocculation Paddle Shaft Penetration In Basin Wall	EA			\$ -		\$ -	
12.4	Remove Rotating Arm Sweeps In Secondary Basins	L.S.			\$ -		\$ -	
12.5	Repair Weir Closure Plate	EA			\$ -		\$ -	
12.6	Repair Damaged Guardrail	L.S.			\$ -		\$ -	
SOUTH PRIMARY BASIN SUBTOTAL				TOTAL	\$ 104,901.00	TOTAL	\$ 179,635.00	42%
NORTH PRIMARY BASIN								
1.1	Project Mobilization	L.S.	1	\$ 46,060.00	\$ 46,060.00	\$ 114,450.00	\$ 114,450.00	60%
1.2	Concrete Formwork	Incidental						
1.3	Shoring	Incidental						
2.1	Concrete Topping Repair	S.F.	2200	\$ 41.00	\$ 90,200.00	\$ 61.00	\$ 134,200.00	33%
2.3	Partial Depth Concrete Floor Repair	S.F.	200	\$ 57.00	\$ 11,400.00	\$ 71.00	\$ 14,200.00	20%
2.4	Full Depth Concrete Floor Repair	S.F.			\$ -		\$ -	
2.6	Concrete Curb Repair	S.F.	25	\$ 68.00	\$ 1,700.00	\$ 158.00	\$ 3,950.00	57%
2.7	Concrete Topping Removal And Replacement	S.F.			\$ -		\$ -	
2.8	Concrete Curb Removal And New Topping Replacement	S.F.			\$ -		\$ -	
3.1	Overhead Slab Repair	S.F.	50	\$ 133.00	\$ 6,650.00	\$ 275.00	\$ 13,750.00	52%
4.1	Concrete Wall Repair	S.F.	500	\$ 95.00	\$ 47,500.00	\$ 283.00	\$ 141,500.00	66%
4.2	Concrete Wall – Flume Replacement	S.F.			\$ -		\$ -	
4.3	Concrete Wall – Platform Slab Replacement	S.F.			\$ -		\$ -	
5.1A & 5.1B	Column Repair	S.F.	50	\$ 112.00	\$ 5,600.00	\$ 320.00	\$ 16,000.00	65%

				John Rohrer Contracting Company		Western Specialty Contractors'		% Difference
Task Item	Task Description	Units	Base Bid Quantity	Unit Price	EXTENSION (1) X (2)	Unit Price	EXTENSION (1) X (2)	
7.1	Crack Repair	L.F.	50	\$ 16.00	\$ 800.00	\$ 14.00	\$ 700.00	13%
7.5	Cove Sealant Installation	Incidental to Task Items 10.5						
7.6	Epoxy Injection	L.F.	400	\$ 43.00	\$ 17,200.00	\$ 66.00	\$ 26,400.00	35%
10.5	Clean, Coat, And Seal Base Of Handrail Posts	EA	80	\$ 78.00	\$ 6,240.00	\$ 112.00	\$ 8,960.00	30%
12.2	Remove Flocculation Paddles In Secondary Basins	L.S.			\$ -		\$ -	
12.3	Seal Flocculation Paddle Shaft Penetration In Basin Wall	EA			\$ -		\$ -	
12.4	Remove Rotating Arm Sweeps In Secondary Basins	L.S.			\$ -		\$ -	
12.5	Repair Weir Closure Plate	EA			\$ -		\$ -	
12.6	Repair Damaged Guardrail	L.S.			\$ -		\$ -	
NORTH PRIMARY BASIN SUBTOTAL				TOTAL	\$ 233,350.00	TOTAL	\$ 474,110.00	51%
SOUTH SECONDARY BASIN								
1.1	Project Mobilization	L.S.	1	\$ 35,648.00	\$ 35,648.00	\$ 67,300.00	\$ 67,300.00	47%
1.2	Concrete Formwork	Incidental						
1.3	Shoring	Incidental						
2.1	Concrete Topping Repair	S.F.	200	\$ 48.00	\$ 9,600.00	\$ 61.00	\$ 12,200.00	21%
2.3	Partial Depth Concrete Floor Repair	S.F.	1100	\$ 57.00	\$ 62,700.00	\$ 71.00	\$ 78,100.00	20%
2.4	Full Depth Concrete Floor Repair	S.F.			\$ -		\$ -	
2.6	Concrete Curb Repair	S.F.	25	\$ 68.00	\$ 1,700.00	\$ 158.00	\$ 3,950.00	57%
2.7	Concrete Topping Removal And Replacement	S.F.			\$ -		\$ -	
2.8	Concrete Curb Removal And New Topping Replacement	S.F.			\$ -		\$ -	
3.1	Overhead Slab Repair	S.F.	10	\$ 150.00	\$ 1,500.00	\$ 275.00	\$ 2,750.00	45%
4.1	Concrete Wall Repair	S.F.	55	\$ 95.00	\$ 5,225.00	\$ 283.00	\$ 15,565.00	66%
4.2	Concrete Wall – Flume Replacement	S.F.	320	\$ 88.00	\$ 28,160.00	\$ 189.00	\$ 60,480.00	53%
4.3	Concrete Wall – Platform Slab Replacement	S.F.	60	\$ 68.00	\$ 4,080.00	\$ 560.00	\$ 33,600.00	88%
5.1A & 5.1B	Column Repair	S.F.	40	\$ 112.00	\$ 4,480.00	\$ 263.00	\$ 10,520.00	57%
7.1	Crack Repair	L.F.	100	\$ 16.00	\$ 1,600.00	\$ 14.00	\$ 1,400.00	13%
7.5	Cove Sealant Installation	Incidental to Task Items 10.5						
7.6	Epoxy Injection	L.F.	225	\$ 43.00	\$ 9,675.00	\$ 66.00	\$ 14,850.00	35%
10.5	Clean, Coat, And Seal Base Of Handrail Posts	EA	70	\$ 78.00	\$ 5,460.00	\$ 112.00	\$ 7,840.00	30%
12.2	Remove Flocculation Paddles In Secondary Basins	L.S.	1	\$ 4,000.00	\$ 4,000.00	\$ 14,280.00	\$ 14,280.00	72%
12.3	Seal Flocculation Paddle Shaft Penetration In Basin Wall	EA	2	\$ 535.00	\$ 1,070.00	\$ 1,660.00	\$ 3,320.00	68%
12.4	Remove Rotating Arm Sweeps In Secondary Basins	L.S.	1	\$ 1,225.00	\$ 1,225.00	\$ 15,100.00	\$ 15,100.00	92%
12.5	Repair Weir Closure Plate	EA	1	\$ 4,475.00	\$ 4,475.00	\$ 7,750.00	\$ 7,750.00	42%
12.6	Repair Damaged Guardrail	L.S.			\$ -		\$ -	
SOUTH SECONDARY BASIN SUBTOTAL				TOTAL	\$ 180,598.00	TOTAL	\$ 349,005.00	48%
NORTH SECONDARY BASIN								
1.1	Project Mobilization	L.S.	1	\$ 97,033.00	\$ 97,033.00	\$ 146,970.00	\$ 146,970.00	34%
1.2	Concrete Formwork	Incidental						
1.3	Shoring	Incidental						
2.1	Concrete Topping Repair	S.F.		\$ 41.00	\$ -		\$ -	

				John Rohrer Contracting Company		Western Specialty Contractors'		% Difference
Task Item	Task Description	Units	Base Bid Quantity	Unit Price	EXTENSION (1) X (2)	Unit Price	EXTENSION (1) X (2)	
2.3	Partial Depth Concrete Floor Repair	S.F.	2000	\$ 58.00	\$ 116,000.00	\$ 71.00	\$ 142,000.00	18%
2.4	Full Depth Concrete Floor Repair	S.F.			\$ -		\$ -	
2.6	Concrete Curb Repair	S.F.			\$ -		\$ -	
2.7	Concrete Topping Removal And Replacement	S.F.	3800	\$ 52.00	\$ 197,600.00	\$ 63.00	\$ 239,400.00	17%
2.8	Concrete Curb Removal And New Topping Replacement	S.F.	650	\$ 74.00	\$ 48,100.00	\$ 63.00	\$ 40,950.00	15%
3.1	Overhead Slab Repair	S.F.	10	\$ 155.00	\$ 1,550.00	\$ 275.00	\$ 2,750.00	44%
4.1	Concrete Wall Repair	S.F.	35	\$ 95.00	\$ 3,325.00	\$ 283.00	\$ 9,905.00	66%
4.2	Concrete Wall – Flume Replacement	S.F.			\$ -		\$ -	
4.3	Concrete Wall – Platform Slab Replacement	S.F.			\$ -		\$ -	
5.1A & 5.1B	Column Repair	S.F.	40	\$ 112.00	\$ 4,480.00	\$ 263.00	\$ 10,520.00	57%
7.1	Crack Repair	L.F.	50	\$ 16.00	\$ 800.00	\$ 14.00	\$ 700.00	13%
7.5	Cove Sealant Installation	Incidental to Task Items 10.5						
7.6	Epoxy Injection	L.F.	125	\$ 43.00	\$ 5,375.00	\$ 66.00	\$ 8,250.00	35%
10.5	Clean, Coat, And Seal Base Of Handrail Posts	EA	70	\$ 78.00	\$ 5,460.00	\$ 112.00	\$ 7,840.00	30%
12.2	Remove Flocculation Paddles In Secondary Basins	L.S.	1	\$ 4,000.00	\$ 4,000.00	\$ 14,280.00	\$ 14,280.00	72%
12.3	Seal Flocculation Paddle Shaft Penetration In Basin Wall	EA	2	\$ 535.00	\$ 1,070.00	\$ 1,660.00	\$ 3,320.00	68%
12.4	Remove Rotating Arm Sweeps In Secondary Basins	L.S.	1	\$ 1,225.00	\$ 1,225.00	\$ 15,100.00	\$ 15,100.00	92%
12.5	Repair Weir Closure Plate	EA	1	\$ 1,818.00	\$ 1,818.00	\$ 7,750.00	\$ 7,750.00	77%
12.6	Repair Damaged Guardrail	L.S.	1	\$ 1,100.00	\$ 1,100.00	\$ 4,680.00	\$ 4,680.00	76%
NORTH SECONDARY BASIN SUBTOTAL				TOTAL	\$ 488,936.00	TOTAL	\$ 654,415.00	25%

CONSTRUCTION SCHEDULE ALTERNATE TABLE				John Rohrer Contracting Company		Western Specialty Contractors'		
Task Item	ADD/DEDUCT	Task Description	Units	Quantity	Unit Price	Task Subtotal	Unit Price	Task Subtotal
-	CONSTRUCTION	CONTINUOUS	1	L.S.	\$ -	\$ -	\$ (20,000.00)	\$ (20,000.00)
CONSTRUCTION SCHEDULE ALTERNATE TOTAL					TOTAL	\$ -	TOTAL	\$ (20,000.00)

		John Rohrer Contracting Company		Western Specialty Contractors'		
BASE BID GRAND TOTAL (WITHOUT ALTERNATE)		TOTAL	\$ 1,058,526.00	TOTAL	\$ 1,739,990.00	39%
BASE BID GRAND TOTAL (WITH ALTERNATE)		TOTAL	\$ 1,058,526.00	TOTAL	\$ 1,719,990.00	38%

Bid Package Submissions		
Complete Bid Form	Yes	Yes
Bid Bond	Yes	Yes
Qualifications	Yes	Yes
Financial Statement	No Concerns	No Concerns
Comments	1. Did not submit formal acknowledgement of Addenda with Bid 2. Low Bidder	1.High Bidder