

WALTER P MOORE

March 2, 2014

Mr. Troy Shaw
Project Engineer
City of Lawrence, Department of Utilities
1720 West 3rd Street
P.O. Box 708
Lawrence, KS 66044

Re: Kaw River and Clinton Reservoir Water Treatment Plants – Roofing Replacements
Project #UT1416 Bid #B1501
WPM Project: D08-14014-00
Award Recommendation Letter

Dear Mr. Shaw:

The bid opening for the Roofing Replacement projects at the Kaw River and Clinton Reservoir Water Treatment Plants was held on Tuesday, February 24, 2015, at 2 P.M. at the Lawrence City Hall. Three (3) bids were received ranging from \$367,080.00 to \$462,100.00 (inclusive of Base Bids and Add Alternates).

Diamond Everley Roofing submitted the low Base Bid of \$297,180.00 with an additional \$69,900.00 in Add Alternates for a total bid amount of \$367,080.00. We take no exceptions to the information provided in the bid package, and the package appears to be in conformance with the submission requirements detailed in the contract documents. Please see the attached bid summary table for a detailed breakdown of the received bids.

On the Qualification Statement, Diamond Everley listed the previous roofing replacement contract they performed at the Kaw River Water Treatment Plant in 2009. As you may be aware, Walter P Moore was the Engineer-of-Record on that project and provided construction administration. During the course of construction, persistent manpower, scheduling, and documentation issues on Diamond Everley's part delayed completion of the contract; liquidated damages were levied against Diamond Everley as a result.

While we feel that Diamond Everley Roofing is qualified to perform this scope of work, we have concerns about the quality of project management and construction oversight that will be provided by this contractor. Please let us know if you would like to discuss further.

Sincerely,

WALTER P. MOORE AND ASSOCIATES, INC.



Lurita McIntosh Blank, REWC, CDT
Senior Associate
Diagnostics Group
Enclosure

Bid Tabulation Summary Table

Kaw River and Clinton Reservoir Water Treatment Plants Roofing Replacement
WPM Project No. D08-14014-00

Date: Monday, March 2, 2015

				BOONE BROTHERS ROOFING		KIRBERG ROOFING		DIAMOND EVERLEY	
Task Item	Task Description	Units	Base Bid Quantity	Unit Price	Task Subtotal	Unit Price	Task Subtotal	Unit Price	Task Subtotal
Base Bid - 1Kaw River									
1.1	PROJECT MOBILIZATION AND GENERAL CONDITIONS	1	LS		\$ 5,000.00		\$ 8,690.00		\$ 930.00
2.1	DEMOLITION AND SUBSTRATE PREPARATION – ROOFING	1	LS		\$ 8,400.00		\$ 21,950.00		\$ 5,930.00
2.2	RECYCLING PROGRAM – ROOFING MATERIALS	1	LS		\$ 5,000.00		\$ 500.00		\$ 400.00
3.1	DECK REPAIR– CONCRETE ROOF DECK	1	LS						
a	Prepare and patch concrete spalls	10	SF	\$ 100.00	\$ 1,000.00	\$ 11.00	\$ 110.00	\$ 17.00	\$ 170.00
b	Cover openings at concrete curbs	1	LS		\$ 6,800.00		\$ 950.00		\$ 3,530.00
6.1	ROUGH CARPENTRY	1	LS		\$ 4,200.00		\$ 5,825.00		\$ 3,150.00
7.1	ROOFING INSULATION – TAPERED POLYISOCYANURATE INSULATION	1	LS		\$ 31,000.00		\$ 23,950.00		\$ 31,400.00
7.2	PROTECTION BOARD – 1/2-INCH THICK SILICONIZED GYPSUM BOARD	1	LS		\$ 4,300.00		\$ 4,550.00		\$ 3,600.00
7.3	LOW SLOPE ROOFING MEMBRANE – SINGLE PLY THERMOPLASTIC ROOFING	1	LS		\$ 25,330.00		\$ 42,450.00		\$ 40,300.00
7.4	FLASHING AND SHEET METAL TRIM	1	LS		\$ 8,970.00		\$ 10,750.00		\$ 7,280.00
7.5	ROOFING SYSTEM WARRANTY	1	LS		\$ 1,500.00		\$ 1,100.00		\$ 550.00
22.1	PLUMBING WORK	1	LS		\$ 3,000.00		\$ 11,050.00		\$ 840.00
26.1	ELECTRICAL WORK	1	LS		\$ 1,500.00		\$ 2,500.00		\$ -
30.1	CLEAN ADJACENT PVC ROOF SURFACE	1	LS		\$ 3,300.00		\$ 3,200.00		\$ 3,030.00
BASE BID TOTALS				TOTAL	\$ 109,300.00	TOTAL	\$ 137,575.00	TOTAL	\$ 101,110.00

Base Bid - Clinton Reservoir									
Task Item	Task Description	Units	Base Bid Quantity	Unit Price	Task Subtotal	Unit Price	Task Subtotal	Unit Price	Task Subtotal
1.1	PROJECT MOBILIZATION AND GENERAL CONDITIONS	1	LS		\$ 9,300.00		\$ 16,860.00		\$ 3,190.00
2.1	DEMOLITION AND SUBSTRATE PREPARATION – ROOFING	1	LS		\$ 33,675.00		\$ 24,850.00		\$ 14,990.00
2.2	RECYCLING PROGRAM – ROOFING MATERIALS	1	LS		\$ 10,000.00		\$ 500.00		\$ 1,320.00
6.1	ROUGH CARPENTRY	1	LS		\$ 2,500.00		\$ 2,200.00		\$ 1,200.00
7.1A	ROOFING INSULATION – INSULATION REPLACEMENT	4000	SF	\$ 5.70	\$ 22,800.00	\$ 1.58	\$ 6,300.00	\$ 2.79	\$ 11,150.00
7.1B	ROOFING INSULATION – TAPERED POLYISOCYANURATE INSULATION	1	LS		\$ -		\$ 1,600.00		\$ -

7.2	PROTECTION BOARD – 1/2-INCH THICK SILICONIZED GYPSUM BOARD	1	LS		\$ 21,800.00		\$ 19,150.00		\$ 16,140.00
7.3	LOW SLOPE ROOFING MEMBRANE – SINGLE PLY THERMOPLASTIC ROOFING	1	LS		\$ 130,000.00		\$ 144,850.00		\$ 120,858.00
7.4	FLASHING AND SHEET METAL TRIM	1	LS		\$ 18,800.00		\$ 20,975.00		\$ 18,880.00
7.5	ROOFING SYSTEM WARRANTY	1	LS		\$ 2,175.00		\$ 2,390.00		\$ 1,832.00
22.1	PLUMBING WORK	1	LS		\$ 7,250.00		\$ 4,400.00		\$ 2,920.00
26.1	ELECTRICAL WORK	1	LS		\$ 2,500.00		\$ 3,600.00		\$ 3,590.00
BASE BID TOTALS				TOTAL	\$ 260,800.00	TOTAL	\$ 247,675.00	TOTAL	\$ 196,070.00

Task Item	Task Description	Units	Base Bid Quantity	Unit Price	Task Subtotal	Unit Price	Task Subtotal	Unit Price	Task Subtotal
<i>Add Alternates- Clinton Reservoir</i>									
3.1	Infill Skylights	1	LS		\$ 92,000.00		\$ 28,650.00		\$ 69,900.00
ADD ALTERNATES TOTALS				TOTAL	\$ 92,000.00	TOTAL	\$ 28,650.00	TOTAL	\$ 69,900.00

BASE BID TOTALS				TOTAL	\$ 370,100.00	TOTAL	\$ 385,250.00	TOTAL	\$ 297,180.00
BASE BID and ADD ALTERNATES TOTALS				TOTAL	\$ 462,100.00	TOTAL	\$ 413,900.00	TOTAL	\$ 367,080.00

<i>Bid Package Submissions</i>			
Project Manual	Yes	Yes	Yes
Revised Bid Form	Yes	Yes; math error of \$290 in contractor's submitted total	Yes
Bid Bond	5%	5%	5%
Qualifications	No exceptions	Not comparable type of membrane	No exceptions
Financial Statement	Dec 2013	Refused to supply	Dec 2013
Manufacturer Certification	Not included	Yes	Not included
Signed Addendum No. 1	Yes	Yes	Yes
Signed Addendum No. 2	Yes	Yes	Yes
Comments	Yes	Add Alt 3.1 seems significantly low	Past negative experience with this contractor at Kaw River in 2009