LAWRENCE HISTORIC RESOURCES COMMISSION ITEM NO. 9: L-2-20-10 STAFF REPORT

A. SUMMARY

L-2-20-10: Hold public hearing for consideration of placing the structure located at 821 New York Street on the Lawrence Register of Historic Places.

B. HISTORIC REGISTER STATUS

821 New York Street is not listed on the State or the National Registers of Historic Places. The property is in the environs of the North Rhode Island Street Historic Residential District, St. Luke A.M.E. Church (900 New York), East Lawrence Industrial Historic District, National Register of Historic Places; and 820 New Jersey, Lawrence Register of Historic Places.

C. REVIEW CONSIDERATIONS

1) History Summary

In 1859 the Republic Engine Company No. 1 was created as the first fire department in Lawrence. This was a volunteer organization with minimal equipment. By 1862, the department disbanded due to lack of equipment, City support, and the war. In 1869, the Head Center Hose Company was organized as the City Fire Department. Edward Manter was elected Chief of the Head Center Hose Company on April 5, 1875. Before Manter's election, the company was filled with political appointees who received exemptions from local taxes and had no training in firefighting, safety, or hose procedures. There were not even horses to pull the engines. Manter put an end to this with his refusal to resign after the election of a new mayor and council in 1882. In a statement to the newspaper, he stated that "no longer would the fire department be a political pawn." Manter's refusal was supported by Lawrence citizens, permitting him to transform the department into a respected city service, to institute practical training and to buy horses to pull the equipment. Manter remained Chief until 1889.

2) Architectural Integrity Summary

The residence was constructed ca.1865-1870. This hybrid between a 1860s hall-stair, two over two house, a side entry house, and a T-house that emerged in the late 1880s with rear additions still has distinguishing historic integrity. This integrity stems from the original balloon frame, clapboard siding, wooden four over four windows with pedimental exterior surrounds, an elaborate Eastlake front porch with turned posts and spindles and a cross gable with a rising sun in the tympanum, arch-paneled front door with side lights and transom, paneled interior doors, 5" pine flooring, capped baseboards, elaborate and plain woodwork around doors and windows, and a turned newel post and spindles of walnut on the front stair.

The front elevation is vertically asymmetrically aligned with the upper 4-over-4 wood windows centered between the two lower windows and the door. The roof is a low pitched front gable. The front porch spans the front elevation and has a cross-gabled entry with fancy turned round posts with brackets, an ornamented cross brace and balustrade. The house retains its original 4-pannel solid wood door with louvered transom and wood screen door.

The south elevation of the original home is mostly flat with the exception of a small upper story window toward the rear of the original section. The $1^{1/2}$ -story addition projects outward from the original portion of the home with a side entry 4-pannel divided light door and two symmetrically aligned 4-over-4 wood windows. The rear shed-roof addition is inset from the middle addition and has a slightly elevated contemporary wood deck that finishes at a rear entrance into the kitchen (modern door and storm door) and offset window.







The east elevation is surrounded by a 2-level deck that wraps from the south elevation around to the rear of the home stepping down as it wraps around to the east elevation. The 1-story shed roof addition with metal siding abuts the rear gable structure just below the second story windows. The shed roof has a series of five square paired windows that reflects a clear-story fenestration pattern. Just below the paired windows is a centrally located 1-over-1 double hung window. Also along the east elevation is an exterior entrance to the basement with a wood cellar door and brick retaining walls.





The property also has a wood shed secondary structure built in sections. The first section has 2" wood clapboard siding with a gable roof. The second and third section has a shed roof and is clad with wide planks of clapboard siding.

3) Context Description

The Edward Manter House is an example of a residential building that was constructed during the historic context associated with the development of Lawrence--the City-building Period (1864-1873) as defined by the Historic Resources of Lawrence, Douglas County, Kansas Multiple Property Documentation Form (MPDF).

The area surrounding the property is dominantly RM24, Multi-Dwelling Residential District. The property to the north located at 313 E8th is zoned CN1, Neighborhood Commercial Center, and to the south the properties along 9th Street are zoned CS, Commercial Strip District.

The nominated property is in the environs of the North Rhode Island Street Historic Residential District, St. Luke A.M.E. Church (900 New York), East Lawrence Industrial Historic District, National Register of Historic Places; 820 New Jersey, Lawrence Register of Historic Places. This property represents the housing and land use patterns during the late nineteenth century and early twentieth century which followed local population, social, economic and economic trends.

4) Planning and Zoning Considerations

821 New York Street is zoned RM24, Multi-Dwelling Residential District. The RM Districts are designed to accommodate multi-Dwelling housing. The Districts are intended to create, maintain, and promote higher Density housing opportunities in areas with good transportation Access. On the basis of maximum allowed Net Density, the RM24, Multi-Dwelling District allows 24 Dwelling Units per acre. At the time of construction and throughout the historic period of significance, the property was located in a residential area.

5) Fiscal Comments

There are no monetary benefits directly associated with nomination of a structure to the Lawrence Register of Historic Places at this time. However, Chapter 22 of the Code of the City of Lawrence does identify mechanisms for financial incentives. If these programs become available in the future, structures listed on the Lawrence Register will be eligible for participation.

Listing on the local Register does help preserve built resources important to Lawrence's history and helps to maintain streetscapes in older neighborhoods through environs reviews.

The original information submitted with nominations for properties to the Lawrence Register is kept on file in the City Planning office for public review and consultation with regard to development projects within the notification area. This type of information is useful, for example, if present or future property owners seek nomination to the State or National Register of Historic Places.

6) Positive/Negative Effects of the Designation

The positive effect of designation is the creation of a permanent record of the historical significance

of an individual property, for its architectural quality or its association with a significant local individual or event. This provides the local Historic Resources Commission, an advisory board, with pertinent historical data which can help to provide an 'historic' perspective to property owners when they desire to improve, add on, or redevelop a property within an older section of the City.

The public accessibility of this information is also a resource as it can be used by realtors, builders/developers, and others in the community prior to a property's resale, redevelopment or rehabilitation. In a more general sense, this information can be used by the Chamber of Commerce and existing businesses and industries to 'identify' one of the facets that makes up Lawrence's *Quality of Living*.

Additional effects of designation are the creation of an arbitrary, 250' environs notification and review area. Within this 250' circle, projects which require city permits, e.g., demolition, redevelopment, renovation or modification, require review by Historic Resources staff or the Commission. These environs reviews permit scrutiny of proposed development/redevelopment by individuals sensitive to historic preservation.

A *Certificate of Appropriateness* or a *Certificate of Economic Hardship* is required to be issued by the Historic Resources Commission before a City permit can be issued for the proposed project. If the Historic Resources Commission denies a *Certificate of Appropriateness* or a *Certificate of Economic Hardship*, the property owner can appeal to the City Commission for a new hearing. The City Commission can uphold the decision of the HRC or it can grant the proposed development over the Historic Resources Commission's action.

The local ordinance 250' environs review area is exceeded by State law with regard to State and/or National Register properties. Certificates of Appropriateness or Economic Hardship are required for a project within the 250' radius of a Local Register property.

Examples of projects which would require review and approval are: projects involving the <u>exterior</u> building which are considered 'structural' changes, demolitions or partial demolitions, rezonings, replats, site plans, variance requests or other items which require a city permit or are the direct result of an action of the City Commission. Minor changes which require a city permit can be administratively approved by the Historic Resources Administrator.

7) Summary of Applicable Designation Criteria

Chapter 22, of the City Code is the *Conservation of Historic Resources Code* for the City of Lawrence. Section 22-403 of this code establishes criteria for the evaluation of an application for nomination to the Lawrence Register of Historic Places.

D. CRITERIA FOR EVALUATION AND DESIGNATION - Section 22-403

Nine criteria are provided within this section for review and determination of qualification as a Landmark or Historic District. These criteria are set forth below with staff's recommendations as to which this application qualifies for:

(1) Its character, interest, or value as part of the development, heritage or cultural characteristics of the community, county, state, or nation;

The East Lawrence neighborhood as identified in the context document Living in East Lawrence: An Essay for a Multiple Listings Nomination, encompasses approximately 50 city blocks east of Massachusetts Street to Oregon Street and from the Kansas River to 15th Street. This neighborhood and the structures located therein are valuable as part of the development of the City of Lawrence documenting residential land use from the late nineteenth century and the early twentieth century. The East Lawrence neighborhood followed local population, social, economic and architectural building patterns described in the MPDF Historic Resources of Lawrence, Douglas County, Kansas. The vernacular architecture and the cohesive streetscapes of the neighborhood emphasize the commonalities of the diverse populations that settled in this area of Lawrence. While the structures in the neighborhood reflect the evolution of vernacular architecture and the incorporation of stylistic details over time, the relationship between the structures based on location, streetscape, building materials, workmanship, mass and scale create a distinct neighborhood identity that is of value to the study of the history of the City of Lawrence. The context describes the neighborhood as a "working class" neighborhood and the history of the people who lived in these vernacular structures is important to the understanding of the growth and development of the community as a whole.

- (2) Its location as a site of a significant local, county, state, or national event;
- (3) Its identification with a person or persons who significantly contributed to the development of the community, county, state, or nation;

Edward Manter was the elected Chief of Lawrence's first Fire Department and was instrumental in creating a respected city service.

- (4) Its embodiment of distinguishing characteristics of an architectural style valuable for the study of a period, type, method of construction, or use of indigenous materials;
- (5) Its identification as a work of a master builder, designer, architect, or landscape architect whose individual work has influenced the development of the community, county, state or nation;
- (6) Its embodiment of elements of design, detailing, materials, or craftsmanship that render it architecturally significant;
- (7) Its embodiment of design elements that make it structurally or architecturally innovative;
- (8) Its unique location or singular physical characteristics that make it an established or familiar visual feature;
- (9) Its character as a particularly fine or unique example of a utilitarian structure; including, but not limited to farmhouses, gas stations, or other commercial structures, with a high level of integrity or architectural significance.

The HISTORIC RESOURCES CODE establishes a procedure to follow in the forwarding of a recommendation to the City Commission on applications for listing on the local register.

"Following the hearing the commission shall adopt by resolution a recommendation to be submitted to the city commission for either (a) designation as a landmark or historic district; (b) not to designate as a landmark or historic district; or, (c) not to make a recommendation. The resolution shall be accompanied by a report to the city commission containing the following information:

The Historic Resources Commission needs to formulate its recommendation in response to the following subsections section 22-404.2 (b):

- (1) Explanation of the significance or lack of significance of the nominated landmark or historic district as it relates to the criteria for designation as set forth in section 22-403;
- (2) Explanation of the integrity or lack of integrity of the nominated landmark or historic district:
- (3) In the case of a nominated landmark found to meet the criteria for designation:
 - (A) The significant exterior architectural features of the nominated landmark that should be protected; and,
 - (B) The types of construction, alteration, demolition, and removal, other than those requiring a building or demolition permit, that cannot be undertaken without obtaining a certificate of appropriateness.
- (4) In the case of a nominated historic district found to meet the criteria for designation:
 - (A) The types of significant exterior architectural features of the structures within the nominated historic district that should be protected;
 - (B) The types of construction, alteration, demolition, and removal, other than those requiring a building or demolition permit, that cannot be undertaken without obtaining a certificate of appropriateness.
 - (C) A list of all key contributing, contributing and noncontributing sites, structures and objects within the historic district.
- (5) Proposed design guidelines for applying the criteria for review of certificates of appropriateness to the nominated landmark or historic district.
- (6) The relationship of the nominated landmark or historic district to the on-going effort of the commission to identify and nominate all potential areas and structures that meet the criteria for designation.
- (7) A map showing the location of the nominated landmark or the boundaries of the nominated historic district.

E. RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends the Edward Manter House located at 821 New York Street for designation as a Landmark on the Lawrence Register of Historic Places pursuant to Criteria #1 and #3, as described in Section 22-403.

If the Historic Resources Commission recommends this property for local nomination, the Commission should adopt a resolution for recommendation to be submitted to the City Commission for designation as a landmark. In addition to the resolution, the Commission should direct staff to prepare a report to accompany the resolution including the information set forth in Section 22-404.2(1) - (7) and the environs definition.

Staff recommends the following for the report to the City Commission:

- (1) Explanation of the significance or lack of significance of the nominated landmark or historic district as it relates to the criteria for designation as set forth in section 22-403;
 821 New York is significant for its vernacular Queen Anne Folk architecture and its association with a prominent Lawrence civil service leader Edward Manter.
- (2) Explanation of the integrity or lack of integrity of the nominated landmark or historic district:

This hybrid structure is a T-house side entry with a stair hall, a sub-type of the 2-over-2 house. The two-over-two is the second most frequent house type in East Lawrence accounting for 14.2% of the 798 homes in East Lawrence (6th-15th Streets and New Hampshire to Oregon Streets). The T/L-plan house is the third most represented plan accounting for 10.8% of the East Lawrence housing. This hybrid emerged in the 19th century as people were searching for the next house type that would meet the needs of society and their lifestyle. The structure maintains significant integrity of location, design, materials, and workmanship that make it worthy of preservation.

- (3) In the case of a nominated landmark found to meet the criteria for designation:
 - (A) The significant exterior architectural features of the nominated landmark that should be protected; and,

The wood windows, porch, and siding.

(B) The types of construction, alteration, demolition, and removal, other than those requiring a building or demolition permit that cannot be undertaken without obtaining a certificate of appropriateness.

Alterations to the windows, porch and siding should require a Certificate of Appropriateness.

(5) Proposed design guidelines for applying the criteria for review of certificates of appropriateness to the nominated landmark or historic district.

<u>U.S. Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation</u>, published in 1990, and any future amendments, in addition to any criteria specified by Chapter 22 of the Code of the City of Lawrence, Kansas.

The HRC may also adopt *An Analysis of the Environs for 821 New York Street* and delineate how environs review will be conducted in relation to the listed property. The analysis is attached with the delineation of environs areas.

(6) The relationship of the nominated landmark or historic district to the on-going effort of the commission to identify and nominate all potential areas and structures that meet the criteria for designation.

A primary goal of the HRC is to build a Register of properties which show the growth of Lawrence since its inception. The nomination of this property is another step toward registering a wide variety of historic properties which together present a visual history of Lawrence's past. The goal of the Lawrence Register of Historic Places is to represent all socioeconomic strata; businesses and industries which illustrate the diversity that has been prevalent in Lawrence since its inception.

(7) A map showing the location of the nominated landmark.

See attached

Environs Definition See attached

