City of Lawrence Historic Resources Commission November 17th, 2011 Minutes

MEMBERS PRESENT: Arp, Quillin, Meyer, Williams, Foster

STAFF EXCUSED: Tuttle, Wiechert

STAFF PRESENT: Braddock Zollner, Parker, Groves

PUBLIC PRESENT: Zaudke, Walsh, Myers, Hamilton, Cunningham

HISTORIC RESOURCES COMMISSION AGENDA MEETING- NOVEMBER 22ND 2011--6:30 PM ACTION SUMMARY

Commissioners present: Arp, Quillin, Meyer, Williams, Foster

Commissioner excused: Tuttle, Wiechert

Staff present: Braddock Zollner, Parker, Groves

ITEM NO. 1: ACTION SUMMARY

Commissioner Foster stated the applicant for 900 New Hampshire Street had stated there would be no changes to the project proposal. He said the statement was omitted from the action summary.

Commissioner Meyer stated Bill Flemming had stated there would not be a change to the project proposal.

ACTION TAKEN

Motioned by Commissioner Foster, seconded by Commissioner Williams, to defer the October 27th, 2011 Action Summary.

Motion carried unanimously, 5-0

ITEM NO. 2: COMMUNICATIONS

- a) No communications from other commissions, State Historic Preservation Officer, or the general public.
- b) No abstentions from specific agenda items by commissioners.

ITEM NO. 3:

DR-04-46-11 707 Vermont Street; Library Addition; Certified Local Government Review, Certificate of Appropriateness Review and Downtown Urban Conservation Overlay District Review. The property is in the environs of these National Register Properties: Eldridge Hotel (701 Massachusetts), Lawrence Downtown Historic District, Old West Lawrence Historic District and the Lucy Hobbs Taylor Building (809 Vermont St). It is also in the environs of The House Building (729-731 Massachusetts), Lawrence and Kansas Register and Miller's Hall (723-725 Massachusetts), Lawrence Register of Historic Places. The property is also located in the Urban Conservation Overlay District. Submitted by Sean Zaudke of Gould Evans Associates for the City of Lawrence, property owner of record.

STAFF PRESENTATION

Ms. Groves presented the item.

APPLICANT PRESENTATION

Sean Zaudke, Gould Evans, presented an update on the project at 707 Vermont Street. He said there was a previous general approval to the mass of the structure. He said the entry was now shifted and was directly off Vermont Street and the structure was pulled closer to the property line on the north east edge side. Mr. Zaudke stated there would be an energy reduction of approximately fifty percent and the addition would wrap the existing structure. Mr. Zaudke stated he made daily trips to the library and studied the pattern of visitors. He said the areas by the windows were in constant use and there would be a reading area all around the perimeter of the structure with daylight streaming in around the building. Mr. Zaudke stated the corners of the structure would be open to have a visual connection to the interior of the library. He said the main entry would be open and there would be a large canopy. Mr. Zaudke stated there was a ten feet drop from the east to the west of the plaza area. He said the Plaza area would be multi functioning and would have a natural amphitheatre. Mr. Zaudke stated terracotta would be installed on the outside area of the structure and the glass and terracotta would be integrated so that little framing would be seen. He said there would not be a lot of columns introduced and the parking structure would be open and transparent. He said the skin system would be a perforated metal material and would work well with the terracotta. Mr. Zaudke stated banners would separate the second story to break down massing. He said there was an added tier to the parking structure that was requested by the City of Lawrence. Mr. Zaudke stated the existing mechanical units would be retained and were relatively low in height.

Commissioner Foster asked what changes were made from the last Architectural Review Committee meeting. He said parking signs were not allowed in the downtown area and the Kentucky elevation looked like it was on stilts.

Mr. Zaudke stated he had checked the existing mechanical equipment and that was the only modification made to the project.

Ms. Braddock Zollner asked Mr. Zaudke if the proposed signage would remain at the parking area.

Mr. Zaudke stated there had been no conversation regarding the signage and he did not believe it was proposed. He said the signage was a more detailed issue and the signage shown in the rendering would be subjected to further conversation.

Commissioner Foster asked if improvements could be made to the Kentucky elevation.

Mr. Zaudke stated he liked the sense of openness on the Kentucky Street side. He said there was a concern with the more skin the more the cost would rise. He said there was a need for a sense of openness off of Kentucky Street. He said there was a slope off the north plaza side and the south side of the structure was level.

PUBLIC COMMENT

KT Walsh asked the applicant what the total height of the parking garage would be.

Mr. Zaudke said the approximate height would be forty eight feet.

Ms. Walsh asked if an extra five feet would be added for mechanical devices.

Mr. Zaudke said additional height would not be added for mechanical devices.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Commissioner Meyer stated the parking structure, alternate, and the addition required a vote by the Commission.

ACTION TAKEN

Motioned by Commissioner Williams, seconded by Commissioner Quillin, to approve the project at 707 Vermont Street, to include the library addition and parking structure, with an additional condition to exclude the proposed signage, and with the following conditions as listed in the staff report:

- 1. The final materials selection will be reviewed and approved by the Architectural Review Committee.
- 2. The final construction documents will be reviewed and approved by the Architectural Review Committee prior to the release of a building permit.
- 3. Any changes to the project will be submitted to the HRC for review and approval prior to the commencement of the related work.

Motion carried unanimously, 5-0

ACTION TAKEN

Motioned by Commissioner Williams, seconded by Commissioner Quillin, to approve the project at 707 Vermont Street, to include the parking structure alternate, with an additional condition to exclude the proposed signage, and with the following conditions as listed in the staff report:

- 1. The final materials selection will be reviewed and approved by the Architectural Review Committee.
- 2. The final construction documents will be reviewed and approved by the Architectural Review Committee prior to the release of a building permit.
- 3. Any changes to the project will be submitted to the HRC for review and approval prior to the commencement of the related work.

Motion carried unanimously, 5-0

ITEM NO. 4:

DR-09-146-11 516 W 6th Street; Garage Demolition and New Construction; Certified Local Government Review and Certificate of Appropriateness Review; The property is located in the Pinckney I Historic District, National Register of Historic Places. The residence is contributing, the garage structure is non-contributing. It is also in the environs of Old West Lawrence Historic District, National Register and the Dillard House (520 Louisiana St), Lawrence Register of Historic Places. Submitted by Amanda and Michael Murphy, property owners of record.

STAFF PRESENTATION

Ms. Groves presented the item.

APPLICANT PRESENTATION

Mike Myers, Hernly Architects, stated the garage had a lot of structural issues and it did not belong with the house. He said the roof pitch was very flat and there was rot and damage from the flatness. Mr. Myers stated the plate and studs were rotted and the floor slab was cracked.

Commissioner Foster asked Mr. Myers why the doors were not symmetrical.

Mr. Myers said there was a potential for stairs to be added on the inside.

PUBLIC COMMENT

There was no public comment.

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

There was no Commission discussion.

ACTION TAKEN

Motioned by Commissioner Williams, seconded by Commissioner Arp, to approve the project at 516 W 6th Street, based on the supporting documentation in the staff report, and with the following conditions as listed in the staff report:

- 1. The existing accessory structure will be documented through measured drawings and photography prior to demolition;
- 2. Staff will be allowed to photograph before, during and upon completion of the project;
- 3. Any changes to the approved project will be submitted to the Historic Resources Administrator prior to the commencement of any related work.

Motion carried unanimously, 5-0

ITEM NO. 5:

DR-10-165-11 900 Massachusetts St; Kiosk; Certified Local Government Review and Downtown Urban Conservation Overlay District Review; The property is in the environs of Lawrence's Downtown Historic District, Carnegie Library (200 W 9th St) and North Rhode Island Street Historic Residential District, National Register of Historic Places. It is also within the the environs of Plymouth Congregational Church (925 Vermont), National and Kansas Registers of Historic Places. The property is also located in the Downtown Urban Conservation Overlay District. Submitted by Cathy Hamilton of Downtown Lawrence, Inc for US Bank Corporate Real Estate, the property owner of record.

STAFF PRESENTATION

Ms. Groves presented the item.

APPLICANT PRESENTATION

Cathy Hamilton, Downtown Lawrence Director, said downtown Overland Park had a similar structure on Santa Fe Drive. She said she requested Doug Compton donate material from the 900 New Hampshire Street project. Ms. Hamilton stated Mr. Compton donated material, labor and Treanor Architects design for the Kiosk. She said every business from City Hall to South Park, and Vermont to New Hampshire Street would have a map and key located within the Kiosk. Ms. Hamilton stated there would also be marketing material and a small space for advertising. She said the glass case would be locked and the map would be updated every quarter.

Commissioner Meyer asked Ms. Hamilton what would be placed at the top area of the Kiosk.

Ms. Hamilton stated the top portion of the Kiosk would include advertisements for First Management and Treanor Architects. She said after the first year the ads would be sold to fund maintenance of the Kiosk.

Commissioner Arp asked if the lighting would be on the inside of the case.

Ms. Hamilton stated the lighting would be installed on the inside of the case.

Commissioner Meyer asked where the Kiosk would be placed.

Chris Cunningham, Treanor Architects, said the location was to be determined. He said the Kiosk could be incorporated with the planter at the US Bank. He said the final location was open.

Commissioner Arp asked the applicant if the plan was to have the Kiosk located at the corner of 9th and Massachusetts Street.

Ms. Hamilton stated the original plan was to place the Kiosk on the US Bank property but the idea was very complicated and there was a decision that the Kiosk should be placed on City property.

Commissioner Williams asked if there should be a Kiosk on each corner downtown.

Mr. Cunningham stated 9th and Massachusetts Street had the largest open space.

Ms. Hamilton stated there would also be maintenance issues to test.

Commissioner Meyer asked if the height of the Kiosk was due to the advertising space.

Ms. Hamilton stated the footprint of downtown was long and narrow. She said the height of the Kiosk could be brought down but the advertising space would bring value to the project. She said the advertisement would send people on a walking tour of downtown Lawrence.

Commissioner Williams said the Kiosk was a great idea and it should be downtown.

Ms. Hamilton stated she would like to take advantage of the generosity of Doug Compton and Treanor Architects.

PUBLIC COMMENT

There was no public comment

COMMISSION DISCUSSION

Commissioner Meyer asked Staff if advertising on the sign was a problem.

Ms. Braddock Zollner said the City was viewing the sign as a sign of public interest. She said the project would go to the City Commission for approval and Staff would like the overall height reduced.

Commissioner Meyer said she liked the idea of a map downtown but the advertising space could be a concern with future projects.

Ms. Braddock Zollner said the sign code did not allow advertising off site. She said the sign would be a sign of public interest.

Commissioner Williams asked Ms. Hamilton who would monitor the revenue from the advertising.

Ms. Hamilton stated Downtown Lawrence Inc would monitor the revenue.

Commissioner Williams asked how Downtown Lawrence Inc was associated with the City of Lawrence.

Ms. Hamilton said Downtown Lawrence Inc received funds from the City's General Fund.

Commissioner Williams said there were square footage limitations in the sign guidelines.

Ms. Braddock Zollner said the Downtown Guidelines did not include monument signs. She said the sign was a sign of public interest.

Ms. Hamilton said the Kiosk size could be modified.

Commissioner Williams said the size of the sign should conform to the Sign Code.

Commissioner Foster asked Ms. Braddock Zollner who enforced the Sign Code.

Ms. Braddock Zollner said Development Services enforced the Sign Code but this project was being reviewed as a sign of public interest.

Commissioner Meyer asked Ms. Braddock Zollner if she was a property owner downtown could she put a monument sign downtown.

Ms. Braddock Zollner said the City Commission would make the final decision.

KT Walsh said often times in historic downtowns there was signs on an angle that provided information.

ACTION TAKEN

Motioned by Commissioner Williams, seconded by Commissioner Arp, to approve the project at 900 Massachusetts Street, based on the supporting documentation in the staff report, and with the following conditions as listed in the staff report:

- 1. The applicant will work with City Staff to identify the appropriate placement for the sign.
- 2. The applicant will work with Staff to determine if a reduction in overall height is possible without compromising the aesthetically pleasing proportions of the sign.
- 3. Any changes to the approved project will be submitted to the Historic Resources Administrator prior to the commencement of any related work.

Motion carried unanimously, 5-0

ITEM NO. 6: MISCELLANEOUS MATTERS

- A. No Board of Zoning Appeals applications received since October 27, 2011.
- B. No demolition permits received since the October 27, 2011 meeting.
- C. Review of Administrative and Architectural Review Committee approvals since October 27, 2011:

Administrative Reviews

DR-08-137-11

831 Massachusetts Street; Renovation; Certified Local Government Review and Downtown Urban Conservation Overlay District Review. The property is a contributing structure to Lawrence's Downtown Historic District, National Register of Historic Places and in the environs of the Carnegie Library (200 W 9th St) and the Lucy Hobbs Taylor House (809 Vermont), National Register of Historic Places. It is also in the environs of Plymouth Congregational Church, National and Kansas Register of Historic Places. Submitted by Bryan Dyche of The Tan Company for Janice Houk Trustee, property owner of record.

DR-09-152-11

1700 Massachusetts Street; Antenna; Certified Local Government Review and Certificate of Appropriateness Review. The property is in the environs of the Edward House House (1646 Massachusetts), Lawrence and National Register of Historic Places and the Eugene Goodrich House (1711 Massachusetts),

National Register of Historic Places. Submitted by T-Mobile for City of Lawrence, property owner of record.

DR-09-153-11

729 Massachusetts Street; Sign Permit; Certified Local Government Review, Certificate of Appropriateness Review, Downtown Conservation Overlay District Review. The property is a contributing structure to Lawrence's Downtown Historic District, National Register of Historic Places and is listed in the Lawrence Register of Historic Places. It is in the environs of Miller's Hall (723 Massachusetts), Lawrence Register of Historic Places, Lucy Hobbs Taylor House (809 Vermont), the United States Post Office (645 New Hampshire) and the Eldridge Hotel (701 Massachusetts), National Register of Historic Places. The property is also within the Downtown Urban Conservation Overlay District. Submitted by Lawrence Sign Up for Lids on behalf of Kanwaka LLC, property owner of record.

DR-09-154-11

716.5 Massachusetts Street; Second Floor Remodel; Certified Local Government Review, Certificate of Appropriateness Review, Downtown Urban Conservation Overlay District Review. The property is a contributing structure to Lawrence's Downtown Historic District, National Register of Historic Places and is within the Downtown Urban Conservation Overlay District. It is in the environs of Miller's Hall (723 Massachusetts), Lawrence Register of Historic Places, the House Building (729-731 Massachusetts), Kansas and Lawrence Register of Historic Places, the United States Post Office (645 New Hampshire) and the Eldridge Hotel (701 Massachusetts), National Register of Historic Places. Submitted by Ed Jarboe of Paul Werner Architects for 716 East, LLC, property owner of record.

DR-09-155-11

1400 Massachusetts Street; Site Plan; Certified Local Government Review; The property is in the environs of the South Rhode Island and New Hampshire Streets Historic Residential District, National Register of Historic Places. Submitted by CL Maurer of Landplan Engineering for City of Lawrence Public Schools USD 497, property owner of record.

DR-09-156-11

711 Connecticut Street; Rehabilitation; Certified Local Government Review, Certificate of Appropriateness Review, Downtown Urban Conservation Overlay District Review. The property is in the environs of the North Rhode Island Street Historic Residential District, National Register of Historic Places and the Octavious McAllaster House (724 Rhode Island), Lawrence Register of Historic Places. It is also within the Downtown Urban Conservation Overlay District. Submitted by James Dunn, property owner of record.

DR-09-157-11

739 Massachusetts Street; Sign Permit; Certified Local Government Review, Certificate of Appropriateness Review, Downtown Urban Conservation Overlay District Review; The property is a non-contributing structure to Lawrence's Downtown Historic District, National Register of Historic Places and is within the Downtown Urban Conservation Overlay District. It is in the environs of Miller's Hall (723 Massachusetts), Lawrence Register of Historic Places, the House Building (729-731 Massachusetts), Kansas and Lawrence Register of Historic Places, Lucy Hobbs Taylor House (809 Vermont), and the Eldridge Hotel (701 Massachusetts), National Register of Historic Places. Submitted by Spirit Halloween for Miller Building of Lawrence LLC, property owner of record.

DR-10-158-11

645 New Hampshire Street; Door Replacement; Certified Local Government Review and Downtown Urban Conservation Overlay District Review; The property (United States Post Office) is individually listed on the National Register of Historic Places and is a key contributing structure to Lawrence's Downtown Historic District, National Register of Historic Places. It is within the Downtown Urban Conservation Overlay District and in the environs of the Eldridge Hotel (701 Massachusetts) and the North Rhode Island Street Historic District, National Register of Historic Places. Submitted by Chris Cunningham of Treanor Architects for Postal Investors, LC, property owner of record.

DR-10-159-11

1313 Connecticut Street; Addition; Certified Local Government Review; The property is in the environs of the South Rhode Island and New Hampshire Streets Historic Residential District, National Register of Historic Places. Submitted by Paul Werner Architects for David Johanning and Deborah Headley, property owners of record.

DR-10-160-11

1000 Massachusetts Street; Sign Permit; Certified Local Government Review, Certificate of Appropriateness Review and Downtown Urban Conservation Overlay District Review; The property is in the environs of Lawrence's Downtown Historic District, North Rhode Island Street Historic Residential District, Watkins Bank Building (1047 Massachusetts) and English Lutheran Church (1040 New Hampshire), National Register of Historic Places. It is also in the environs of the Shalor Eldridge House (945 Rhode Island), Kansas and Lawrence Register of Historic Places. Submitted by Luminous Neon for Army Career Center for Berkeley Company LC, property owner of record.

DR-10-161-11

704-728 Connecticut Street; Parking Iot/Site Plan; Certified Local Government Review; The property is in the environs of the North Rhode Island Street Historic Residential District. Submitted by Leticia Cole of Paul Werner Architects for Grant Lichtenburg, property owner of record.

DR-10-162-11

1100 Massachusetts Street; Antenna; Certified Local Government Review, Certificate of Appropriateness Review and Downtown Urban Conservation Overlay District Review; The property (Douglas County Courthouse) is individually listed on the National Register of Historic Places, is a key contributing structure to Lawrence's Downtown Historic District, National Register of Historic Places and within the Downtown Urban Conservation Overlay District. It is in the environs of the English Lutheran Church (1040 New Hampshire), Watkins Bank Building (1047 Massachusetts) and the North Rhode Island Street Historic Residential District, National Register of Historic Places. It is also in the environs of South Park, Lawrence Register of Historic Places. Submitted by Pete Akers of NB&C for Sprint for Douglas County, property owner of record.

DR-10-163-11

6 E 6th Street; Roof Replacement; Certified Local Government Review and Downtown Urban Conservation Overlay District Review; The property is in the environs of the Consolidated Barb Wire Building (546 New Hampshire), Register of Historic Kansas Places, Lawrence's Downtown Historic District, National Register of Historic Places and within the Downtown Urban Conservation Overlay District. Submitted by City of Lawrence, property owner of record.

Motioned by Commissioner Meyer, seconded by Commissioner Williams, to affirm the Administrative Reviews.

Motion carried unanimously, 5-0

D. Dennis Brown, Lawrence Preservation Alliance said the Historic Resources Commission had a unique prevue. He said 900 New Hampshire Street deserved denial but the ruling was what the applicant wanted. He said the applicant asked the Commission for denial and the Commissions denial helped the developer. Mr. Brown stated the Historic Resources Commission was just as important as the Board of Zoning Appeals, Planning Commission and the City Commission. He encouraged the Commission to inform the City Commission the applicant was not valuing the Historic Resources Commissions part of the review process and was seeking a denial to the project. Mr. Brown stated the Architectural Review Committee should not be allowed to meet with an applicant prior to the Historic Resources Commission review. He said the Committee could get into a situation where their vote was bias. He said if the policy continued a staff person should take minutes of the Architectural Review Committee meetings if the public was not allowed to attend the meetings. Mr. Brown said it appeared Staff needed a back up while discussing projects with high powered development teams. Mr. Brown stated the issue needed to be addressed and there needed to be a policy change. He said he received an opinion from a preservation attorney that stated the issue needed to be reviewed.

KT Walsh said she supported Mr. Brown's comments.

Commissioner Meyer stated she understood Mr. Brown's comments. She said allowing the public to attend Architectural Review Committee meetings could turn into three hour meetings disallowing the Committee and an applicant to accomplish anything.

Commissioner Arp asked Staff to explain the policy regarding Architectural Review Committee meetings.

Ms. Braddock Zollner stated there was currently not a policy regarding Architectural Review Committee meetings. She said the State Historic Preservation Office could be asked for input on a policy.

Commissioner Williams suggested Mr. Brown submits a proposal.

Commissioner Meyer asked Mr. Brown what he was proposing.

Mr. Brown stated the Architectural Review Committee should not meet with applicants prior to a Historic Resources Commission vote.

Commissioner Foster stated there had never been an Architectural Review Committee meeting prior to a Historic Resources Commission hearing.

Commissioner Meyer said a project should not be sent to the Architectural Review Committee prior to a Historic Resources Commission hearing.

Mr. Brown stated the Architectural Review Committee was directed to work with the Varsity House applicant prior to the Historic Resources Commission.

Commissioner Williams stated the project came back to the Historic Resources Commission and the Commission did not approve the project.

Mr. Brown stated the recommendation was to work with the Architectural Review Committee and then the project would go back to the Historic Resources Commission for a vote.

Commissioner Foster said the project was deferred to the Architectural Review Committee and then brought back to the Historic Resources Commission. He said he did not recall anything happening like Mr. Brown described. Commissioner Foster said that Mr. Brown suggested using the Architectural Review Committee as a hurdle to slow the project at 900 New Hampshire Street.

Mr. Brown stated he did not suggest the project be deferred and the applicant work with the Architectural Review Committee. He said he wanted the project deferred and the applicant work with the neighborhood and work with preservation professionals within their firm and then come back to the Historic Resources Commission. Mr. Brown stated the ARC met twice with the Varsity House applicant twice prior to the Historic Resources Commission vote on the project.

Commissioner Meyer stated there were benefits to the Architectural Review Committee reviewing projects.

Mr. Brown stated there was a change in policy without the Historic Resources Commission discussing it.

Commissioner Williams suggested Mr. Brown make a proposal. He said the Architectural Review Committee meetings should not be made public.

KT Walsh asked if it was appropriate for the neighborhood to meet with the Architectural Review Committee.

Mr. Meyers said there needed to be a map of appropriate height zones for downtown.

Miscellaneous matters from City staff and Commission members.

Ms. Braddock Zollner asked the Commission to approve the 2012 calendar.

ACTION TAKEN

Motioned by Commissioner Foster, seconded by Commissioner Arp, to approve the 2012 Historic Resources Commission calendar.

Motion carried unanimously, 5-0

Commissioner Meyer asked if the Historic Resources Commission had ever met with the City Commission.

Ms. Braddock Zollner stated the last joint meeting was on sidewalk dining issues.

ACTION TAKEN

Motioned by Commissioner Meyer, seconded by Commissioner Williams, to adjourn the Historic Resources Commission meeting.

Motion carried unanimously, 5-0

ADJOURN -8:15 p.m.